	1	•				
1	Kamala D. Harris					
2	Attorney General of California LINDA L. SUN					
3	Supervising Deputy Attorney General HELENE E. ROUSE					
4	Deputy Attorney General State Bar No. 130426					
5	300 So. Spring Street, Suite 1702 Los Angeles, CA 90013					
6	Telephone: (213) 620-3005 Facsimile: (213) 897-2804					
7	Attorneys for Complainant					
8		RE THE				
9	DEPARTMENT OF CONSUMER AFFAIRS FOR THE BUREAU FOR PRIVATE POSTSECONDARY EDUCATION STATE OF CALIFORNIA					
10	STATE OF C	ALIFURNIA				
11	To do Maria Colo Colo Colo					
12	In the Matter of the Statement of Issues Against:	Case No. 1001404				
13	ALEXANDER TRAINING INSTITUTE OF	STATEMENT OF ISSUES				
14	LOS ANGELES 1526 14 th Street, Suite 110					
15	Santa Monica, ČA 90404					
	Renewal of Approval to Operate Applicant					
16	Institution Code Number 1917381					
17	Respondent.					
18						
19	Complainant alleges:					
20	<u>PAR</u>	TIES				
21	1. Joanne Wenzel (Complainant) brings this Statement of Issues solely in her official					
22	capacity as the Chief of the Bureau for Private Postsecondary Education, Department of					
23	Consumer Affairs.					
24	2. On or about November 1, 1987, the Bureau for Private Postsecondary Education					
25	(Bureau) issued Full Approval to Operate Institution Code Number 1917381 to Alexander					
26	Training Institute of Los Angeles, (Respondent and/or the Institution). Said Full Approval					
27	expired on February 28, 2013, and has not been renewed.					
28	///					
- 11	•					

12

13 14

15

16 17

18

19

20

21

2223

24

25

262728

JURISDICTION

3. This Statement of Issues is brought before the Director of the Department of Consumer Affairs (Director) for the Bureau for Private Postsecondary Education, under the authority of the following laws. All section references are to the Education Code (Code) unless otherwise indicated.

STATUTORY PROVISIONS1

- 4. Code section 94891, subdivision (b) states: "To be granted a renewal of an approval to operate, the institution shall demonstrate its continued capacity to meet the minimum operating standards."
 - 5. Code section 94897 states, in pertinent part:

An institution shall not do any of the following:

(l) Use the terms "approval," "approved," "approval to operate," or "approved to operate" without stating clearly and conspicuously that approval to operate means compliance with state standards as set forth in this chapter. If the bureau has granted an institution approval to operate, the institution may indicate that the institution is "licensed" or "licensed to operate," but may not state or imply either

of the following:

- (1) The institution or its educational programs are endorsed or recommended by the state or by the bureau.
- (2) The approval to operate indicates that the institution exceeds minimum state standards as set forth in this chapter.

* * * *

6. Code section 94910 states, in pertinent part, as follows:

Except as provided in subdivision (d) of Section 94909 and Section 94910.5, prior to enrollment, an institution shall provide a prospective student with a School Performance Fact Sheet containing, at a minimum, the following information, as it relates to the educational program:

(a) Completion rates, as calculated pursuant to Article 16 (commencing with Section 94928).

¹ On October 11, 2009, the California Private Postsecondary Education Act (Act) of 2009 was signed into law. (Educ. Code, §§94800, et seq.) The Act was recently amended, effective January 1, 2015. (See: Senate Bill No. 1247.) This Statement of Issues is based on the postamendment version of the Act.

1 2	(b) Placement rates for each educational program, as calculated pursuant to Article 16 (commencing with Section 94928), if the educational program is designed to lead to, or the institution makes any express or implied claim related to preparing students for, a recognized career, occupation, vocation, job, or job title.
3	* * * *
4	(d) Salary or wage information, as calculated pursuant to Article 16
5	(commencing with Section 94928). * * * *
6	(f) All of the following:
7	(1) A description of the manner in which the figures described in
8	subdivisions (a) to (d), inclusive, are calculated or a statement informing the reader of where he or she may obtain a description of the manner in which the figures described in subdivisions (a) to (d), inclusive, are calculated.
10	(2) A statement informing the reader of where he or she may obtain from
11	the institution a list of the employment positions determined to be within the field for which a student received education and training for the calculation of job placement rates as required by subdivision (b).
12	(3) A statement informing the reader of where he or she may obtain from
13	the institution a list of the objective sources of information used to substantiate the salary disclosure as required by subdivision (d).
14	* * * *
15	7. Code section 94928, subdivision (c), states, in relevant part, that:
16	As used in this article, the following terms have the following meanings:
17	* * * *
18	(c) "On-time graduates" means the number of students who complete a
19	program within 100 percent of the published program length. An institution may separately state completion information for students completing the program within
20	150 percent of the original contracted time, but that information may not replace completion information for students completing within the original scheduled time.
21	Completion information shall be separately stated for each campus or branch of the institution.
22	8. Code section 94929 provides, in pertinent part:
23	(a) An institution shall annually report to the bureau, as part of the annual
24 25	report, and publish in its School Performance Fact Sheet, the completion rate for each program. Except as provided in subdivision (b), the completion rate shall be calculated by dividing the number of on-time graduates by the number of students available for graduation.
26	(b) In lieu of calculating graduation data pursuant to subdivision (a), an
27	institution may report graduation data reported to, and calculated by, the Integrated Postsecondary Education Data System of the United States Department of Education.
28	

1							
	9. Code section 94929.5 provides, in pertinent part, as follows:						
2 3	(a) An institution shall annually report to the bureau, as part of the annual report, and shall publish in its School Performance Fact Sheet, all of the following:						
4	(1) The job placement rate, calculated by dividing the number of graduates employed in the field by the number of graduates available for employment						
5	for each program that is either (1) designed, or advertised, to lead to a particular career, or (2) advertised or promoted with any claim regarding job placement.						
6	* * *						
7 8	(3) Salary and wage information, consisting of the total number of graduates employed in the field and the annual wages or salaries of those graduates stated in increments of five thousand dollars (\$5,000).						
9	10. Code section 94932 sets forth that:						
10	The bureau shall determine an institution's compliance with the requirements of this chapter. The bureau shall have the power to require reports that						
11	institutions shall file with the bureau in addition to the annual report, to send staff to an institution's sites, and to require documents and responses from an institution to						
12	monitor compliance. When the bureau has reason to believe that an institution may be out of compliance, it shall conduct an investigation of the institution. If the bureau						
13	determines, after completing an investigation, that an institution has violated any applicable law or regulation, the bureau shall take appropriate action pursuant to this						
4	article.						
15	REGULATORY PROVISIONS						
16	11. California Code of Regulations, title 5, section 71475, states, in pertinent part:						
ا 17	* * * *						
	(e) The institution shall submit at the time it applies for renewal current						
18							
19	financial statements that meet the requirements of section 74115 as follows: (1) for an institution with annual gross revenues of \$500,000 and over, statements shall be audited; (2) for an institution with annual gross revenues less than \$500,000,						
19 20	financial statements that meet the requirements of section 74115 as follows: (1) for an institution with annual gross revenues of \$500,000 and over, statements shall be audited; (2) for an institution with annual gross revenues less than \$500,000, statements shall be reviewed.						
19 20 21	financial statements that meet the requirements of section 74115 as follows: (1) for an institution with annual gross revenues of \$500,000 and over, statements shall be audited; (2) for an institution with annual gross revenues less than \$500,000, statements shall be reviewed. 12. California Code of Regulations, title 5, section 71700 states that "The Bureau may						
19 20 21 22	financial statements that meet the requirements of section 74115 as follows: (1) for an institution with annual gross revenues of \$500,000 and over, statements shall be audited; (2) for an institution with annual gross revenues less than \$500,000, statements shall be reviewed. 12. California Code of Regulations, title 5, section 71700 states that "The Bureau may request that an institution document compliance with the standards set forth in the Act and this						
19 20 21 22 23	financial statements that meet the requirements of section 74115 as follows: (1) for an institution with annual gross revenues of \$500,000 and over, statements shall be audited; (2) for an institution with annual gross revenues less than \$500,000, statements shall be reviewed. 12. California Code of Regulations, title 5, section 71700 states that "The Bureau may request that an institution document compliance with the standards set forth in the Act and this Division to obtain and maintain an approval to operate."						
19 20 21 22	financial statements that meet the requirements of section 74115 as follows: (1) for an institution with annual gross revenues of \$500,000 and over, statements shall be audited; (2) for an institution with annual gross revenues less than \$500,000, statements shall be reviewed. 12. California Code of Regulations, title 5, section 71700 states that "The Bureau may request that an institution document compliance with the standards set forth in the Act and this						
19 20 221 222 223 224 225	financial statements that meet the requirements of section 74115 as follows: (1) for an institution with annual gross revenues of \$500,000 and over, statements shall be audited; (2) for an institution with annual gross revenues less than \$500,000, statements shall be reviewed. 12. California Code of Regulations, title 5, section 71700 states that "The Bureau may request that an institution document compliance with the standards set forth in the Act and this Division to obtain and maintain an approval to operate."						
19 20 21 22 23 24	financial statements that meet the requirements of section 74115 as follows: (1) for an institution with annual gross revenues of \$500,000 and over, statements shall be audited; (2) for an institution with annual gross revenues less than \$500,000, statements shall be reviewed. 12. California Code of Regulations, title 5, section 71700 states that "The Bureau may request that an institution document compliance with the standards set forth in the Act and this Division to obtain and maintain an approval to operate." 13. California Code of Regulations, title 5, section 71745, states as follows: (a) The institution shall document that it has at all times sufficient assets						

1	reasonable opportunity to complete the programs and obtain their degrees or diplomas.
2	(3) Maintain the minimum standards required by the Act and this chapter.
3	(4) Pay timely refunds as required by Article 13 of the Act.
4	(5) Pay all operating expenses due within 30 days.
5	(6) Maintain a ratio of current assets to current liabilities of 1.25 to 1.00
6	or greater at the end of the most recent fiscal year when using generally accepted accounting principles, or for an institution participating in Title IV of the federal
7	Higher Education Act of 1965, meet the composite score requirements of the U.S. Department of Education. For the purposes of this section, current assets does not include: intengible assets including and dwill as included intengible assets.
8	include: intangible assets, including goodwill, going concern value, organization expense, startup costs, long-term prepayment of deferred charges, and non-returnable deposits, or state or federal grant or loan funds that are not the property of the
9 10	institution but are held for future disbursement for the benefit of students. Unearned tuition shall be accounted for in accordance with general accepted accounting principles.
11	(b) At an institution's request, the Bureau may consider the financial
12	resources of a parent company if the parent company, as defined by section 94853 of the Code, meets and maintains all of the following provisions:
13	(1) consents in writing to be sued in California;
14	(2) consents in writing to be subject to the jurisdiction of the Bureau with respect to the institution's regulation under the Act and this Chapter;
15 16	(3) designates and maintains an agent for service of process, consistent with section 74190;
17	(4) agrees in writing to pay any refund, claim, penalty, or judgment that the institution is obligated to pay; and
18	(5) files financial reports, maintains financial records, and consents in
19	writing to permit the inspection and copying of financial records to the same extent as is required of the institution.
20 21	(c) An institution shall provide to the Bureau its most current financial statements upon request.
22	14. California Code of Regulations, title 5, section 74112, subdivisions (d), (e) & (g) stat
23	in relevant part:
	* * * *
24	
25	(d) Completion Rates. Reporting of completion rates for an institution's Annual Report and Performance Fact Sheet shall include, for each educational
26	program, the number of students who began program as defined in subdivision (b), the number of students available for graduation, number of graduates, and completion
27	rate(s). An optional column may be added to include completion rate data for students completing within 101-150% of the published program length. For an institution
28	reporting completion data pursuant to section 94929(b) of the Code, completion data

shall be separately reported for each program. The Performance Fact Sheet shall disclose, if true, that the completion data is being reported for students completing within 150% of the published program length, and that data is not being separately reported for students completing the program within 100% of the published program length.

Completion rates shall be included in the Performance Fact Sheet in a format substantially similar to the chart below, including the footnoted information below (dates, numbers, and other data shown are for example only):

Completion Rates (includes data for the two calendar years prior to reporting)

Name of Educational Program (Program Length)

	Number of	Students		
Calendar	Students Who	Available for	•	Completion
Year	Began Program ¹	Graduation ²	Graduates ³	$Rate^4$
20XX	100	98	70	71%
20XY	80	80	55	69%

Students Completing After Published Program Length - 150% Completion Rate

Name of Educational Program (Program Length)

	Number of	Students		150%
Calendar	Students Who	Available for	150%	Completion
Year	Began Program ¹	Graduation ²	Graduat	es ⁵ Rate ⁶
203/3/	100	0.0		- 50 /
20XX	100	98	25	26%
20XY	80	80	23	29%

¹ "Number of Students Who Began Program" is the number of students who began the program who are scheduled to complete the program within the reporting calendar year.

- ² "Students available for graduation" is the number of students who began program minus the number of "Students unavailable for graduation," which means those students who have died, been incarcerated, or called to active military duty.
- ³ "Graduates" is the number of students who completed the program within 100% of the published program length.
- ⁴ "Completion Rate" is the number of Graduates divided by the Number of Students Available for Graduation.
- ⁵ "150% Graduates" is the number of students who completed the program within 101-150% of the published program length.

the reporting calendar year.

26

27

28

Graduates

week

50

11

Employed in

the Field at least

² "Number of Graduates" is the number of students who have completed the program within 100% of the published program length.

³ "Graduates available for employment" means the number of graduates minus the number of graduates unavailable for employment. "Graduates unavailable for employment" means graduates who, after graduation, die, become incarcerated, are called to active military duty, are international students that leave the United States or do not have a visa allowing employment in the United States, or are continuing their education in an accredited or bureau-approved postsecondary institution.

⁴ "Graduates employed in the field" means graduates who report that they are gainfully employed within six months of graduation in a position for which the skills obtained through the education and training provided by the institution are required or provided a significant advantage to the graduate in obtaining the position.

⁵ Placement Rate is calculated by dividing the number of graduates gainfully employed in the field by the number of graduates available for employment.

(g) Salary and Wage Information.

All Salary and Wage Information shall be reported to the Bureau pursuant to section 94929.5(c) of the Code and, if required by section 94910(d) of the Code, shall be included in the Performance Fact Sheet, for each educational program, in a format substantially similar to the chart below, including the footnoted information (dates, numbers, salaries, and other data shown are for example only).

Salary and Wage Information (includes data for the two calendar years prior to reporting)

Name of Educational Program (Program Length)

Annual Salary and Wages Reported by Graduates Employed in the Field³

Calenda Year	Graduates ar Available for Employment		315,000.00 - \$20,000.00	\$20,001,00 - \$25,000.00	\$25,001.00 - \$30,000.00	\$30,001.00 - \$35,000.00	Students Not Reporting Salary
20XX	100	70	5	40	6	3	16
20XY	80	55	5	7	3	5	35

¹ "Graduates available for employment" means the number of graduates minus the number of graduates unavailable for employment. Graduates unavailable for employment means graduates who, after graduation, die, become incarcerated, are called to active military duty, are international students that leave the United States or do not have a visa allowing employment in the United States, or are continuing their education in an accredited or bureau-approved postsecondary institution.

² "Graduates employed in the field" means graduates who are gainfully employed within six months of graduation in a position for which the skills obtained through the education and training provided by the institution are required or provided a significant advantage to the graduate in obtaining the position.

³ Salary is as reported by the student. Not all graduates reported salary.

more than one agency.

17. Section 125.3 of the Business and Professions Code provides, in pertinent part, that the Director may request the administrative law judge to direct a licentiate found to have committed a violation or violations of the licensing act to pay a sum not to exceed the reasonable costs of the investigation and enforcement of the case.

FACTUAL BACKGROUND

- 18. ATI is an institution in Santa Monica, California which provides training, leading to certification, as an "Alexander Technique" teacher, and accepted tuition from students for completion of its program.
- 19. On or about February 25, 2013, the Bureau received Application No. 25877, the "Application for Renewal of Approval to Operate and Offer Educational Programs for Non-Accredited Institutions" (application for renewal) from Respondent. Respondent submitted a "Financial Report 2011", which was not reviewed or audited by a Certified Public Accountant (CPA), with its application for renewal.
 - 20. On or about February 26, 2013, the Burcau issued a deficiency letter to Respondent.
- 21. On or about March 3, 2013, Respondent sent the Bureau a letter stating that it had a small student population and small operating budget and used simple accounting procedures. Respondent claimed that the cost of preparation of a more elaborate financial statement would be more than they pay in annual fees for approval, and enclosed another copy of the same 2011 financial statement which it had already included in its application for renewal.
- 22. On or about September 30, 2014, an Enforcement Inspection Analyst with the Bureau conducted an announced compliance inspection of the Institution, which resulted in multiple possible violations of the Code. The Enforcement Inspection Analyst performed a visual inspection of the Institution's campus, reviewed institutional records, policies and procedures, interviewed the Institution's owner, administrators and faculty and administered an anonymous survey to students. There were violations which were found and corrected at the on-site

²The Alexander technique is a way of learning how you can get rid of harmful tension in your body. (See: http://www.alexandertechnique.com/at.htm.)

1.

inspection. However, the following violations were found and remained after the inspection:

- a. Violations of the Institution's Enrollment Agreement which failed to contain all of the statements which were required by the Code.
- b. A random sampling of Respondent's student records for current, graduated and withdrawn/incomplete students were reviewed and were determined to be incomplete in that they failed to contain: properly executed enrollment agreements, verification of prior education, copies of documents signed by the students and the institution, financial ledgers, and transcripts. The student files did not contain any financial documents and it was noted by the Institution that someone outside of the school handles their financial documents. Moreover, the student files did not contain academic transcripts for each student who graduated, showing all of the courses and units upon which the certification was based. These were material violations.
- c. The files of five instructors for the Institution were reviewed, and it was determined that documents establishing completion of continuing education requirements were not maintained in three of the five instructor files.
- 23. On or about September 30, 2014, the Bureau issued Notice to Comply 1917381 09 14 to the Institution and Respondent, notifying them of violations of Sections 94900 and 94911 along with violations of California Code of Regulations, title 5, sections 71720 and 71920.
- 24. On or about October 24, 2014, the Bureau received a written response from Respondent related to each of the violations in Notice to Comply 1917381 09 14.
- 25. On or about November 3, 2014, the Burcau determined that Respondent's written response and the proof which it submitted demonstrated that it had corrected all four of the deficiencies in Notice to Comply 1917381 09 14. Therefore, the Bureau sent Respondent a letter dated November 3, 2014, notifying it that the response demonstrated compliance with the minor violations noted, and no further response was required.
- 26. On or about September 30, 2015, the Bureau sent Respondent a deficiency letter regarding Respondent's Application for Renewal for Approval to Operate for an Institution Not Accredited, #25877.

- 27. On or about October 30, 2015, the Bureau received a response to the deficiency letter from Respondent which was dated October 22, 2015. In the letter, Respondent Lyn Klein states "Please see the enclosed response regarding our financial document", but no financial document was actually enclosed with the letter. In addition, Respondent's letter states that their website "... now has the Annual Report, Fact Sheet and Catalogue available under our Site Map heading, State Approval." Another letter from Respondent to the Bureau dated October 21, 2015 requested an exception to the requirement that the Institution's financial statements must be reviewed by a CPA "because it would cost thousands of dollars".
- 28. On or about November 1, 2015, Respondent sent an email to the Bureau, indicating that it did not include the financial statement which was referred to in its prior letter, and attaching a copy of the 2013 financial statement.
- 29. On or about December 7, 2015, the Bureau sent Respondent a "Notice of Denial" letter.
- 30. On or about February 5, 2016, Respondent sent the Bureau a letter requesting an administrative hearing to appeal the denial of its application for a renewal of its license.

FIRST CAUSE FOR DENIAL OF APPLICATION

(Failed to Submit Adequate Financial Statements)

31. Respondent's application is subject to denial under Code sections 94891, subdivision (b) and 94928, subdivision (c), in that the Institution did not provide current financial statements which have been reviewed and/or audited by a CPA, who is not an employee, officer, or corporate director or member of the governing board of the institution, in accordance with the generally accepted accounting principles established by the American Institute of Certified Public Accountants, in violation of California Code of Regulations, title 5, sections 71475, subdivision (e), 71745, subdivisions (b)(5) and (c), and 74115. Respondent incorporates by reference herein Paragraphs 18-30, above.

SECOND CAUSE FOR DENIAL OF APPLICATION

(Violated School Performance Fact Sheet Requirements)

32. Respondent's application is subject to denial under Code sections 94932, as follows:

- a. Respondent violated Code sections 94910, subdivision (a), 94929, subdivision (a), and 94928, and California Code of Regulation, title 5, section 74112, subdivision (d), in that Respondent reports in its School Performance Fact Sheet (SPFS) that in 2013, two students began the program, two students were available for graduation and those two graduated on time. However, the Completion Rates for Students Completing After Published Program Length (101-150% Completion Rate) state, two students began the program, two students were available for graduation and two students completed and graduated within 101-150% of the published program length. Pursuant to Code section 94928, subdivision (c), graduates are the number of students who complete a program within 100% of the published program length and those students completing within 150% of the contracted program length. It is not possible for two students who were scheduled to complete in 2013 to graduate both on time and within 101-150% of the program length. Substantiating documentation was not provided to determine whether the students graduated on time or within 101-150% of the program length.
- b. Respondent violated Code sections 94910, subdivision (a) and 94929, subdivision (a), and California Code of Regulation, title 5, section 74112, subdivision (d), in that Respondent reports in its SPFS that in 2013, two students began the program and two students completed within the published program length, and the SPFS documents a 100% completion rate. The SPFS data also documents that in 2013, two students began the program and two students completed within the published program length, and the SPFS documents a 150% completion rate. Pursuant to Code section 94929, subdivision (a), the completion rate shall be calculated by dividing the number of graduates by the number of students available for graduation. The On Time Completion and the Completion Rates for Students Completing After the Published Program Length percentages are mathematically incorrect.
- c. Respondent failed to include Placement Rates, in violation of Code sections 94910, subdivision (b) and 94929.5, subdivision (a)(1) and California Code of Regulation, title 5, section 74112, subdivision (e), as follows:
- (1) In 2013, the SPFS includes Placement Rates that state that the Placement Rates for Graduates Employed in the Field; Placement Rate Employed in the Field; Graduates

Employed in the Field an average of less than 32 hours per week; and Graduates Employed in the Field at least 32 hours per week document "see attached list" and "see attached." A numerical calculation is required. Additionally, there was no attached document.

- (2) In 2013, the SPFS documents one student for the "Number of Graduates" and one student for the "Graduates Available for Employment". However, these numbers are not consistent with the Institution's 2013 SPFS data reported for "On Time and For Students Completing After Published Program Length" completion rates.
- (3) For 2014, the SPFS includes Placement Rates which state that "Placement Rates for Graduates Employed in the Field"; "Placement Rate Employed in the Field"; "Graduates Employed in the Field" an average of less than 32 hours per week; and "Graduates Employed in the Field" at least 32 hours per week document "see attached list" and "see attached." A numerical calculation is required. Additionally, there was no attached document.
- (4) In 2014, the SPFS documents three graduates for "Graduates Available for Employment". However, these numbers are not consistent with the Institution's 2014 SPFS data reported for "On Time and For Students Completing After Published Program Length" completion rates.
- d. Respondent failed to include in its SPFS a statement informing students where they may obtain from the institution a list of employment positions determined to be within the field for which a student received education and training for the calculation of job placement rates, pursuant to Section 94910, subdivision (f)(2). The Institution's SPFS includes the sample verbiage provided by the Bureau, but was not updated to reflect the Institution's website address. Therefore, students do not know exactly where the list or employment positions may be obtained.
- c. Respondent's Salary and Wage Information in the SPFS for 2013 and 2014 states, under the Annual Salary and Wages Reported Graduates Employed in the Field header, which documents salary categories, "see attached" for the \$15,000-\$20,000 and the other are blank, without the required numerical information. A corrected calculation is required. Additionally, without this information the Bureau is unable to determine the accuracy of the students not reporting salary.