1	KAMALA D. HARRIS					
2	Attorney General of California DIANN SOKOLOFF					
3	Supervising Deputy Attorney General CARTER OTT					
4	Deputy Attorney General State Bar No. 221660					
	1515 Clay Street, 20th Floor					
5	P.O. Box 70550 Oakland, CA 94612-0550					
6	Telephone: (510) 622-2219 Facsimile: (510) 622-2270					
7	E-mail: Carter.Ott@doj.ca.gov Attorneys for Complainant					
8	BEFORE THE					
9	DEPARTMENT OF CONSUMER AFFAIRS					
10	FOR THE BUREAU FOR PRIVATE POSTSECONDARY EDUCATION STATE OF CALIFORNIA					
11						
12	In the Matter of the Statement of Issues Case No. 1000952					
13	Against:					
14	AB TRUCK DRIVING SCHOOL; MOHAN SINGH, 50% OWNER; NANJIT STATEMENT OF ISSUES					
15	SINGH, 50% OWNER					
16	Application for Renewal of Approval to Operate an Institution Non-Accredited					
17	Respondent.					
18	School Code 4307141					
19						
20	Complainant alleges:					
21	<u>PARTIES</u>					
22	1. Joanne Wenzel (Complainant) brings this Statement of Issues solely in her official					
23	capacity as the Chief of the Bureau for Private Postsecondary Education, Department of					
24	Consumer Affairs.					
25	2. On or about August 31, 2010, the Bureau for Private Postsecondary Education					
26	("Bureau") received an Application for Renewal of Approval to Operate an Institution Non-					
27	Accredited (application number 22868) from Respondent AB Truck Driving School; Mohan					
28	Singh, 50% Owner; and Manjit Singh, 50% Owner ("Respondent"). Between July 30, 2011 and					
	1					

March 21, 2014, the Bureau and Respondent exchanged correspondence regarding Respondent's application.

3. On or about July 23, 2015, the Bureau issued Respondent a Notice of Denial of Application for Renewal of Approval to Operate. On or about August 18, 2015, the Bureau received a request from Respondent for an administrative hearing regarding the denial of its application.

JURISDICTION

- 4. This Statement of Issues is brought before the Director of Department of Consumer Affairs (Director) for the Bureau, under the authority of the following laws. All section references are to the Education Code unless otherwise indicated.
- 5. California Business and Professions Code Section 118, subdivision (b) provides, in part:
- "(b) The suspension, expiration, or forfeiture by operation of law of a license issued by a board in the department, or its suspension, forfeiture, or cancellation by order of the board or by order of a court of law, or its surrender without the written consent of the board, shall not, during any period in which it may be renewed, restored, reissued, or reinstated, deprive the board of its authority to institute or continue a disciplinary proceeding against the licensee upon any ground provided by law or to enter an order suspending or revoking the license or otherwise taking disciplinary action against the licensee on any such ground.
 - 6. Section 94886 provides:

"Except as exempted in Article 4 (commencing with Section 94874) or in compliance with the transition provisions in Article 2 (commencing with Section 94802), a person shall not open, conduct, or do business as a private postsecondary educational institution in this state without obtaining an approval to operate under this chapter."

7. Section 94887 provides:

"An approval to operate shall be granted only after an applicant has presented sufficient evidence to the bureau, and the bureau has independently verified the information provided by the applicant through site visits or other methods deemed appropriate by the bureau, that the

11.	Section	94910	provides,	in	nart:
T T.	COMMI	ノサノエひ	pro vidos,	LAR	Paul

"Prior to enrollment, an institution shall provide a prospective student with a School Performance Fact Sheet containing, at a minimum, the following information, as it relates to the educational program:

- "(a) Completion rates, as calculated pursuant to Article 16 (commencing with Section 94928).
- "(b) Placement rates for each educational program, as calculated pursuant to Article 16 (commencing with Section 94928), if the educational program is designed to lead to, or the institution makes any express or implied claim related to preparing students for, a recognized career, occupation, vocation, job, or job title.
- "(c) License examination passage rates for programs leading to employment for which passage of a state licensing examination is required, as calculated pursuant to Article 16 (commencing with Section 94928).
- "(d) Salary or wage information, as calculated pursuant to Article 16 (commencing with Section 94928).

. , ,

- 12. Section 94929 provides, in part:
- "(a) An institution shall annually report to the bureau, as part of the annual report, and publish in its School Performance Fact Sheet, the completion rate for each program. Except as provided in subdivision (b), the completion rate shall be calculated by dividing the number of graduates by the number of students available for graduation.

. . . . , ,

- 13. Section 94929.5 provides, in part:
- "(a) An institution shall annually report to the bureau, as part of the annual report, and shall publish in its School Performance Fact Sheet, all of the following:
- "(1) The job placement rate, calculated by dividing the number of graduates employed in the field by the number of graduates available for employment for each program that is either (1)

designed, or advertised, to lead to a particular career, or (2) advertised or promoted with any claim regarding job placement.

- "(2) The license examination passage rates for the immediately preceding two years for programs leading to employment for which passage of a state licensing examination is required, calculated by dividing the number of graduates who pass the examination by the number of graduates who take the licensing examination the first time that the examination is available after completion of the educational program. The institution shall use state agency licensing data to calculate license examination passage rates. If those data are unavailable, the institution shall calculate the license examination passage rate in a manner consistent with regulations adopted by the bureau.
- "(3) Salary and wage information, consisting of the total number of graduates employed in the field and the annual wages or salaries of those graduates stated in increments of five thousand dollars (\$5,000).

....

14. California Code of Regulations, title 5, section 70000 provides, in part:

- | |

- "(q) 'Mission' means an institution's stated educational reasons to exist. A mission statement contains all of the following characteristics:
- "(1) The mission includes the institution's broad expectations concerning the education that students will receive, including the acquisition of the body of knowledge presented in the educational program, the development of intellectual, analytical, and critical abilities, and the fostering of values such as a commitment to pursue lifelong learning; and
- "(2) The mission relates to the educational expectations of the institution's students, faculty and community that the institution serves.
- "(r) 'Objectives' are the goals and methods by which the institution fulfills its mission and transforms it into measurable student learning outcomes for each educational program.

....,

/////

program unless there have been no substantive changes since the last submission. If there have been no substantive changes made the institution may so state and is not required to provide documentation.

. . .

"(bb) The application shall include a copy of the institution's catalog, in published or proposed-to-be-published form. The catalog shall meet the requirements of the Act and of section 71810.

••••

16. California Code of Regulations, title 5, section 71710 provides, in part:

"In order to meet its mission and objectives, the educational program defined in section 94837 of the Code shall be comprised of a curriculum that includes:

"(a) those subject areas that are necessary for a student to achieve the educational objectives of the educational program in which the student is enrolled;

. . .

- 17. California Code of Regulations, title 5, section 71735 provides, in part:
- "(a) An institution shall have sufficient facilities and necessary equipment to support the achievement of the educational objectives of all of the courses and educational programs in which students are enrolled. If an institution represents that the educational service will fit or prepare a student for employment in a particular occupation or as described in particular job titles, either of the following conditions shall be met:
- "(1) The equipment used for instruction or provided to the student shall be comparable in model type or features to equipment generally used in those occupations or job titles at the time the instruction is offered.
- "(2) The institution shall establish that the equipment used for instruction or provided to a student is not obsolete and is sufficient for instructional purposes to reasonably assure that a student acquires the necessary level of education, training, skill, and experience to obtain employment in the field of training and to perform the tasks associated with the occupation or job title to which the educational program was represented to lead.

(2) A statement of the institution's missions and purposes and the objectives underlying

8

26

27

28

each of its educational programs;

• • •

(4) Language proficiency information, including: (A) the level of English language proficiency required of students and the kind of documentation of proficiency, such as the Test of English as a Foreign Language (TOEFL), that will be accepted; and (B) whether English language services, including instruction such as ESL, are provided and, if so, the nature of the service and its cost;

....;

- 20. California Code of Regulations, title 5, section 71865 provides, in part:
- "(a) A Master's degree may only be awarded to a student who demonstrates at least the achievement of learning in a designated major field that is equivalent in depth to that normally acquired in a minimum of 30 semester credits or its equivalent or one year of study beyond the Bachelor's degree.

21. California Code of Regulations, title 5, section 74112 provides, in part:

• •

"(d) Completion Rates. Reporting of completion rates for an institution's Annual Report and Performance Fact Sheet shall include, for each educational program, the number of students who began program as defined in subdivision (b), the number of students available for graduation, number of graduates, and completion rate(s). An optional column may be added to include completion rate data for students completing within 101-150% of the published program length. For an institution reporting completion data pursuant to section 94929(b) of the Code, completion data shall be separately reported for each program. The Performance Fact Sheet shall disclose, if true, that the completion data is being reported for students completing within 150% of the published program length, and that data is not being separately reported for students completing the program within 100% of the published program length.

"Completion rates shall be included in the Performance Fact Sheet in a format substantially similar to the chart below, including the footnoted information below (dates, numbers, and other data shown are for example only):

/////

27

28

of Students Available for Graduation in the published program length period.

Completion

Rate(4)

71%

69%

150%

Rate(6)

26%

29%

Completion

"(e) Placement Rates.

- "(1) Any placement data required by sections 94910(b) and 94929.5(a) of the Code shall be reported for the number of students who began the program as defined in subdivision (b) for each reported calendar year.
- "(2) Placement is measured six months from the graduation date of each student.

 Reporting of placement rates shall include for each educational program: the number of students who began the program, the number of graduates as defined in subdivision (b), graduates available for employment, graduates employed in the field and placement rate(s).
- "(3) Placement rate shall be calculated as follows: the number of graduates employed in the field as defined in subsection 74112(b)(3) divided by the number of graduates available for employment as defined in section 94928(d) of the Code.
- "(4) Graduates employed in the field shall be reported for those graduates employed in the field in a single position that averages under 32 hours per week and those employed in the field in a single position that averages at least 32 hours per week.

"References to the Code are to the California Education Code where the California Private Postsecondary Education Act of 2009 is located.

"Placement rates shall be included in the Performance Fact Sheet in a format substantially similar to the chart below, including the footnoted information below (dates, numbers, and other data shown are for example only):

"Placement Rates (includes data for the two calendar years prior to reporting)

"Name of Educational Program (Program Length)

Calend ar Year	Number of Students Who Began Program(1)	Number of Graduates(2)	Graduates Available for Employment(3)	Graduat es Employe d in the Field(4)	Placeme nt Rate % Employe d in the Field(5)	Graduat es Employe d in the Field an average of less than 32 hours per week	Graduat es Employe d in the Field at least 32 hours per week
20XX	100	70	70	55	79%	5	50
			11				

documented graduates who passed the first examination, number of documented graduates who failed the first examination, the number of graduates for whom data is not available. An optional column may be added to separately report licensing examination data for students who take and pass the exam after failing initially. The Annual Report shall also include a description of the processes for attempting to contact those students.

"For licensing examinations that are not continuously administered, license examination passage rates shall be included in the Performance Fact Sheet in a format substantially similar to the chart below, including the footnoted information below (dates, numbers, and other data shown are for example only):

"Examination Passage Rates (includes data for the two calendar years prior to reporting)

"Name of Educational Program (Program Length)

Number of Students Taking Exam(1)	Exam Date(2)	Number Who Passed Exam	Number Who Failed Exam	Passage Rate(3)
80	2/1/20XX	40	40	50%
100	6/1/20XX	75	25	75%
82	10/1/20XX	68	14	76%
80	2/1/20XY	40	40	50%
100	6/1/20XY	70	30	70%
92	10/1/20XY	62	30	67%

"License examination passage data is not available from the state agency administering the examination. We were unable to collect data from 32 graduates.

"1 Number of Students Taking Exam is the number of students who completed the program within 150% of published program length and for whom the reported exam is the first exam that was available after their completion of the program.

"2 Exam Date is the date for the first available exam after the students completed the program.

"3 Passage Rate is calculated by dividing the number of students who pass the exam by the number of graduates who take the reported licensing exam.

/////

"For licensing examinations that are continuously administered, license examination passage rates shall be included in the Performance Fact Sheet in a format substantially similar to the chart below, including the footnoted information below (dates, numbers, and other data shown are for example only):

"Examination Passage Rates (includes data for the two calendar years prior to reporting)

"Name of Educational Program (Program Length)

Calendar Year	Number of Students Taking Exam(1)	Number Who Passed First Exam Taken(2)	Number Who Failed First Exam Taken(3)	Passage Rate(3)
20XX	80	40	40	50%
20XY	100	75	25	75%

"License examination passage data is not available from the state agency administering the examination. We were unable to collect data from 10 graduates.

"1 Number of Students Taking Exam is the number of students who completed the program within 150% of the published program length and who took the exam in the reported calendar year for the first time.

"2 Number Who Passed First Exam Taken is the number of students who took and passed the licensing exam in the reported calendar year on the first attempt.

"3 Passage Rate is calculated by dividing the number of graduates who pass the exam the first time that they take it by the number of graduates who took the licensing exam for the first time after completion of the program."

"(g) Salary and Wage Information.

"All Salary and Wage Information shall be reported to the Bureau pursuant to section 94929.5(c) of the Code and, if required by section 94910(d) of the Code, shall be included in the Performance Fact Sheet, for each educational program, in a format substantially similar to the chart below, including the footnoted information (dates, numbers, salaries, and other data shown are for example only).

"Salary and Wage Information (includes data for the two calendar years prior to reporting)

	Graduates Available for Employment(1)	Graduate s Employe d in the Field(2)	Annual Salary and Wages Reported by Graduates Employed in the Field(3)				
Calenda r Year			\$15,000.0 0 - \$20,000.0 0	\$20,001.0 0 - \$25,000.0 0	\$25,001.0 0 - \$30,000.0 0	\$30,001.0 0 - \$35,000.0 0	Students Not Reportin g Salary
20XX	100	70	5	40	6	3	16
20XY	80	55	5	7	3	5	35

"1 'Graduates available for employment' means the number of graduates minus the number of graduates unavailable for employment. Graduates unavailable for employment means graduates who, after graduation, die, become incarcerated, are called to active military duty, are international students that leave the United States or do not have a visa allowing employment in the United States, or are continuing their education in an accredited or bureau-approved postsecondary institution.

"2 'Graduates employed in the field' means graduates who are gainfully employed within six months of graduation in a position for which the skills obtained through the education and training provided by the institution are required or provided a significant advantage to the graduate in obtaining the position.

"3 Salary is as reported by the student. Not all graduates reported salary.

FIRST CAUSE FOR DENIAL OF APPLICATION

(Mission and Objectives) (Cal. Code Regs., title 5, §§ 70000, subd. (r) and 71475, subd. (n))

22. Respondent's application is subject to denial because the objectives stated in the application do not meet the definitions set forth in California Code of Regulations, title 5, section 70000, subdivision (r). (Cal. Code Regs., title 5, §§ 70000, subd. (r) and 71475, subd. (n)). In particular, the objectives do not provide the goals and methods by which Respondent's institution will fulfill its mission and transform it into measurable student learning outcomes for each educational program.

(y)(4); and 71735, subds. (a)(1) and (a)(2)). In particular:

a.

22

24

25

23

26

27 28

16

all materials identified in the educational programs curriculums. As a result, the Bureau is not

able to determine whether Respondent complies with California Code of Regulations, title 5,

sections 71475, subdivision (y)(1) and 71735, subdivisions (a)(1) and (a)(2).

The list of materials for instruction maintained by Respondent does not include

- b. Respondent provided a letter purporting to confirm the rental agreement for the use of a property, but that letter is not a copy of the agreement and does not describe the terms of the agreement. (Cal. Code Regs., title 5, § 71475, subd. (y)(2)).
- c. Respondent did not indicate whether significant equipment was owned, leased, rented, or licensed for short or long-term use or owned by another and loaned to be used without charge. (Cal. Code Regs., title 5, § 71475, subd. (y)(4)).

FIFTH CAUSE FOR DENIAL OF APPLICATION

(Catalog)
(Educ. Code §§ 94902, subd. (b)(3); 94910, subds. (a), (b), (c), and (d); 94929, subd. (a); and 94929.5(a)(1), (a)(2), and (a)(3); and Cal. Code Regs., title 5, §§ 70000, subd. (q); 71475, subd. (bb); 71810, subds. (b)(2) and (b)(4); 74112, subds. (d), (e), (f), and (g))

- 26. Respondent's application is subject to denial because Respondent's proposed catalog does not comply with the law. (Educ. Code §§ 94902, subd. (b)(3); 94910, subds. (a), (b), (c), and (d); 94929, subd. (a); and 94929.5(a)(1), (a)(2), and (a)(3); and Cal. Code Regs., title 5, §§ 70000, subd. (q); 71475, subd. (bb); 71810, subds. (b)(2) and (b)(4); 74112, subds. (d), (e), (f), and (g)). In particular:
- a. Respondent's proposed catalog does not indicate the language proficiency information, including the level of English language proficiency required and the type of documentation accepted. (Cal. Code Regs., title 5, §§ 71475, subd. (bb), and 71810, subd. (b)(4)).
- b. The mission and objectives stated in Respondent's proposed catalog do not meet the definitions set forth in California Code of Regulations, title 5, section 70000, subdivision (r). Furthermore, the objectives do not provide the goals and methods by which Respondent's institution will fulfill its mission and transform it into measurable student learning outcomes for each educational program. (Cal. Code Regs., title 5, §§ 70000, subd. (q) and 71810, subd. (b)(2)).
- c. Respondent's Performance Fact Sheet for calendar years 2011 and 2012 does not include completion rates for the Comprehensive Class A License Training Program. No students were enrolled in either year, and Respondent indicated "N/A" for completion rates in

1	<u>PRAYER</u>					
2	WHEREFORE, Complainant requests that a hearing be held on the matters herein alleged,					
3	and that following the hearing, the Director of the Department of Consumer Affairs issue a					
4	decision:					
5	Denying Respondent's Application for Renewal of Approval to Operate an Institution					
6	Non-Accredited; and					
7	 Taking such other and further action as deemed necessary and proper. 					
8						
9	DATED: 11 16 15					
10	JOANNE WENZEL Chief					
11	Bureau for Private Postsecondary Education Department of Consumer Affairs					
12	State of California Complainant					
13						
14	SF2015900709					
15						
16						
17						
18						
19						
20						
21						
22						
23						
24						
25						
26						
27						
28	19					
	19					