1	ROB BONTA		
2	Attorney General of California MARICHELLE S. TAHIMIC		
3	Supervising Deputy Attorney General DIANE VON DER AHE		
4	Deputy Attorney General State Bar No. 294767		
5	600 West Broadway, Suite 1800 San Diego, CA 92101		
6	P.O. Box 85266		
7	Telephone: (619) 738-9463 Facsimile: (619) 645-2012		
8	E-mail: Diane. Von Der Ahe @doj.ca.gov Attorneys for Complainant		
9			
10	BEFORE TI DIRECTOR OF THE DEPARTMENT		
11	FOR THE BUREAU FOR PRIVATE POS STATE OF CALID	STSECONDARY EDUCATION	
12	STATE OF CALIF	TORNIA	
13			
14		se No. BPPE 22-0737	
15	Against:		
16	California Premiere College 2530 N. Grand Ave.,	ATEMENT OF ISSUES	
17	Santa Ana, CA 92705		
18			
19	P.O. Box 10866 Santa Ana, CA 92711		
20	Institution Code No. 3006811		
21	Respondent.		
22			
23			
24	PARTIES		
25	1. Deborah Cochrane (Complainant) brings to	his Statement of Issues solely in her official	
26	capacity as the Chief of the Bureau for Private Postsec	ondary Education, Department of	
27	Consumer Affairs (Bureau).	Consumer Affairs (Bureau).	
28	///		
	1		

1	2. On or about December 28, 2020, the Bureau received an Application for Renewal of
2	Approval to Operate an Institution, Non-Accredited, from California Premiere College
3	(Respondent). Respondent is currently owned by Technologic Institute of Southern California
4	dba California Premiere College, with Martha Zapien as sole shareholder. On or about December
5	23, 2020, Jose Munoz certified under penalty of perjury to the truthfulness of all statements,
6	answers, and representations in the application. The Bureau denied the application on August 25
7	2022.
8	<u>JURISDICTION</u>
9	3. This Statement of Issues is brought before the Director of the Department of
10	Consumer Affairs (Director) for the Bureau for Private Postsecondary Education, under the
11	authority of the following laws. All section references are to the Education Code (Code) unless
12	otherwise indicated.
13	4. Code Section 94886 states:
14	Except as exempted in Article 4 (commencing with section 94874) or in
15 16	postsecondary educational institution in this state without obtaining an approval
17	5. Code Section 94887 states:
18	An approval to operate shall be granted only after an applicant has presented
19	sufficient evidence to the bureau, and the bureau has independently verified the information provided by the applicant through site visits or other methods
20	deemed appropriate by the bureau, that the applicant has the capacity to satisfy the minimum operating standards. The bureau shall deny an application for an
21	approval to operate if the application does not satisfy those standards.
22	STATUTORY PROVISIONS
23	6. Code section 94891, subdivision (b) states, "To be granted a renewal of an approval
24	to operate, the institution shall demonstrate its continued capacity to meet the minimum operating
25	standards."
26	7. Code section 94897, in relevant part, states:
27	An institution shall not do any of the following:
28	

1	(c) Advertise concerning job availability, degree of skill, or length of time required	
2	learn a trade or skill unless the information is accurate and not misleading.	
3		
4	(j) In any manner make an untrue or misleading change in, or untrue or misleading statement related to, a test score, grade or record of grades, attendance record, record	
5	indicating student completion, placement, employment, salaries, or financial information, including any of the following:	
6	(2) Information on more and moleting to the student's alicibility for student	
7	(2) Information or records relating to the student's eligibility for student financial aid at the institution.	
8		
9	(k) Willfully falsify, destroy, or conceal any document of record while that document of record is required to be maintained by this chapter.	
11		
12	8. Code section 94898, subdivision (a), states:	
13	An institution shall not merge classes unless all of the students have received the	
14	same amount of instruction. This subdivision does not prevent the placement of students, who are enrolled in different educational programs, in the same class if that class is part of	
15		
16	9. Code section 94900.5, in relevant part, states:	
17		
18	An institution shall maintain, for a period of not less than five years, at its principal place o business in this state, complete and accurate records of all of the following information:	
19	(a) The educational programs offered by the institution and the curriculum for each.	
20		
21	10. Code section 94902, in relevant part, states:	
22	(b) An enrollment agreement is not enforceable unless all of the following	
23	requirements are met:	
24	(1) The student has received the institution's catalog and School Performance Fact Sheet prior to signing the enrollment agreement.	
25	11. Code section 94909, in relevant part, states:	
26	(a) Except as provided in subdivision (d), before enrollment, an institution shall	
27	provide a prospective student, either in writing or electronically, with a school catalog containing, at a minimum, all of the following:	
28		

ĺ	
1 2 3	(5) A description of the programs offered and a description of the instruction provided in each of the courses offered by the institution, the requirements for completion of each program, including required courses, any final tests or examinations, any required internships or externships, and the total number of credit hours, clock hours, or other increments required for completion.
4	
5	12. Code Section 94910 states:
6 7	Prior to enrollment, an institution shall provide a prospective student with a School Performance Fact Sheet containing, at a minimum, the following information, as it relates to the educational program:
8	(a) Completion rates, as calculated pursuant to Article 16 (commencing with Section 94928).
9	(b) Placement rates, as calculated pursuant to Article 16 (commencing with
10 11	Section 94928), if the educational program is designed to lead to, or the institution makes any express or implied claim related to preparing students for, a particular career, occupation, vocation, job, or job title.
12	
13	(c) License examination passage rates for programs leading to employment for which passage of a state licensing examination is required, as calculated pursuant to Article 16 (commencing with Section 94928).
14	(d) (1) Salary or wage information, as calculated pursuant to Article 16
15	(commencing with Section 94928), if the institution or a representative of the institution makes any express or implied claim about the salary that may be earned after completing the educational program.
16	
17	(2) Additionally, each institution that offers an educational program designed to lead to a particular career, occupation, vocation, trade, job, or job title shall disclose the wage and salary data for the particular career, occupation,
18	trade, job, or job title, as provided by the Employment Development Department's Occupational Employment Statistics, if that data is available.
19	(e) If a program is too new to provide data for any of the categories listed in this
20	subdivision, the institution shall state on its fact sheet: This program is new.
21	Therefore, the number of students who graduate, the number of students who are placed, or the starting salary you can earn after finishing the educational program are
22	unknown at this time. Information regarding general salary and placement statistics may be available from government sources or from the institution, but is not
23	equivalent to actual performance data.
24	(f) All of the following:
25	(1) A description of the manner in which the figures described in subdivisions (a) to (d), inclusive, are calculated or a statement informing the
26	reader of where he or she may obtain a description of the manner in which the figures described in subdivisions (a) to (d), inclusive, are calculated.
27	(2) A statement informing the reader of where he or she may obtain
28	from the institution a list of the employment positions determined to be within the field for which a student received education and training for the calculation

1	
1	of job placement rates as required by subdivision (b).
2	(3) A statement informing the reader of where he or she may obtain from the institution a list of the objective sources of information used to substantiate the salary disclosure as required by subdivision (d).
3	(g) The following statements:
4	(1) This fact sheet is filed with the Bureau for Private Postsecondary
5	Education. Regardless of any information you may have relating to completion rates, placement rates, starting salaries, or license exam passage rates, this fact sheet contains the information as calculated pursuant to state law.
	sheet contains the information as calculated pursuant to state law.
7 8	(2) Any questions a student may have regarding this fact sheet that have not been satisfactorily answered by the institution may be directed to the Bureau for Private Postsecondary Education at (address), Sacramento, CA (ZIP Code), (Internet Web site address), (telephone and fax numbers).
9	
10	<u>REGULATORY PROVISIONS</u>
11	13. Title 5, CCR, section 71400.5 (Regulation 71400.5) states:
12	(a) The inclusion of false or misleading information, or the intentional or negligent omission of pertinent information on any application may result in the denial of the
13	application or a delay in processing, and may be grounds for action pursuant to Article 18 of the Act.
14	(b) In addition to denying an application pursuant to section 94887 of the Code, the Bureau may deny any application based on any act that constitutes grounds for the denial
15 16	of a license under Section 480 of the Business and Professions Code, incorporated herein by reference.
17	14. Title 5, CCR, section 71405, subdivision (a) (Regulation 71405(a)), states:
18	If, after the submission of an application but prior to the Bureau's decision to approve or deny an approval to operate, there is any material change in circumstances affecting any information contained in the application or submitted by the institution in support of the
19	information contained in the application or submitted by the institution in support of the application, the institution shall immediately inform the Bureau in writing.
20 21	15. Title 5, CCR, section 71475 (Regulation 71475), in relevant part, states:
	(t) In addition, the institution shall list in the application, the following for each
22 23	educational program offered unless there have been no substantive changes since the last submission. If there have been no substantive changes made the institution may so state
	and is not required to provide documentation.
24	
25	(5) The mode of instruction;
26	•••
27	
28	

ĺ	
1 2	(7) Whether the educational program is designed to fit or prepare students for employment in any occupation. If so, the application shall identify each occupation and job title to which the institution represents the educational program will lead.
3	
4	(u) For each educational program that the institution offers or proposes to offer, the
5	application shall contain a statement that the educational program meets the requirements
6	of section 71710, as well as the following unless there have been no substantive changes since the last submission. If there have been no substantive changes made the institution may so state and is not required to provide documentation:
7	may so same and is not required to provide documentation.
8	
9	(7) Upon request, the institution shall provide to the Bureau copies of the curriculum or syllabi required pursuant to section 71710.
10	
11	
12	(v) If the institution offers an educational program, or a portion of it, in a language other than English, the application shall contain a description of all of the following for each
13 14	educational program or portion thereof unless there have been no substantive changes since the last submission. If there have been no substantive changes made the institution may so state and is not required to provide documentation.
15	(1) The language in which each educational program will be offered.
16 17	(2) A statement that the institution has contracted with sufficient duly qualified faculty who will teach each language group of students.
18	(3) The language of the textbooks and other written materials to be used by each language group of students.
19	
20	•••
21	(x) The application shall include a statement that the institution has contracted with sufficient duly qualified faculty members who meet the qualifications of section 71720
22	unless there have been no substantive changes since the last submission. If there have
been no substantive changes made the institution may so state and is not requestable provide documentation.	
24	
25	(dd)(1) The application shall contain a description of how records required by Article 9 of
26	the Act or this chapter are or will be organized and maintained, the types of documents
27	contained in student files, how the records are stored, and whether academic and financial records are maintained in separate files. The description shall include a statement of the institution's precedures for acquirity and safekagaing of records upless there have been no
20	institution's procedures for security and safekeeping of records unless there have been no

///

FACTS

- 25. On December 28, 2020, the Bureau received an Application for Renewal of Approval to Operate a Non-Accredited Institution, Application Number 34089, from Respondent.

 Respondent was previously approved to offer the following non-degree educational programs:

 Auto Electric Technician, Auto Electric / Fuel Injection, Business Office Administration,

 Computer Repair / Data Entry, Computer Repair Technician, Electricity Technician Residential and Commercial, Electro Mechanical Assembly, Electronics Tester, Electronics Tester and Assembly Technician, Fashion Design and Sewing, Floral Designer, Fuel Injection Technician, Human Resources Generalist, Medical Assistant Front/Back Office, and Professional Child Care.
- 26. The institution's renewal application also referenced that the institution was seeking to offer some courses remotely due to the COVID-19 pandemic. The Bureau allowed the institution to provide only the following courses via distance learning while the institution's Change in Method application was pending: Business Office Administration, Computer Repair Technician, Medical Assistant Front/Back Office, Human Resources Generalist, Electricity Tech. Residential & Commercial and Auto-Electric/Fuel Injection Tech.
- 27. On February 18, 2021, the Bureau mailed a deficiency letter identifying deficiencies in the following sections of the renewal application: #10 Exemplars of Student Agreements, #16 Financial Resources and Statements, and #21 Catalog.
- 28. On May 31, 2021, the Bureau received the institution's emailed deficiency response (hard copy received 6/21/21), which sought to address deficiencies noted in the Bureau's deficiency letter.
- 29. On August 11, 2021, the Bureau mailed a second deficiency letter identifying deficiencies in the following sections of the renewal application: #1 Institution, #16 Financial Resources and Statements, and #21 Catalog.
- 30. On August 16, 2021, the Bureau denied the institution's Change in Method application, and the institution was therefore no longer permitted to offer any distance education as of this date.

- 31. Between December 28, 2021 and February 28, 2022, the Bureau received the institution's response to the second deficiency letter seeking to remedy deficiencies in sections 10, 16 and 21 of the application.
- 32. On April 8, 2022, the Bureau mailed a third deficiency letter identifying deficiencies in the following sections of the application: #1 Institution, #4 Owner(s), #6 Organization and Management, #10 Exemplars of Student Agreements, #11 Financial Aid Policies, Practices, and Disclosures, #13 Instruction and Degrees Offered, #14 Description of Educational Program, #15 Instruction in Languages other than English, #16 Financial Resources and Statements, #17 Faculty, #18 Facilities and Equipment, and #21 Catalog.
- 33. On June 8, 2022, the Bureau received an emailed copy of the institution's deficiency response (a hard copy was procured by the Bureau during an unannounced campus visit that occurred June 29, 2022), which sought to address all of the areas of deficiencies identified in the third deficiency letter with the exception of #13, Instruction and Degrees Offered.
- 34. On June 29, 2022, Bureau investigators conducted an unannounced visit to the institution during hours that the institution claimed to be providing class instruction, and found the school closed. The owner was contacted and arrived over an hour later.
- 35. On August 25, 2022, the Bureau denied Respondent's Application for Renewal of Approval to Operate a Non-Accredited Institution and sent Respondent a "Notice of Denial."

FIRST CAUSE FOR DENIAL OF APPLICATION

(Offering Unapproved Method of Instruction)

36. Respondent's application is subject to denial under Code section 94891 and Regulation 71700, in conjunction with Code Section 94909, subdivision (a)(5), and Regulations 71475(t)(5) and 71405(a), for offering distance instruction without the Bureau's approval. The circumstances are that the institution represented it only provided instruction at the Bureau-approved campus and satellite locations. However, despite having no approval to operate any programs online after August 16, 2021, the institution's June 7, 2022 catalog stated, "California Premiere College does offer distance education, temporarily." Additionally, page 4 of the enrollment agreement includes disclosures regarding distance instruction. Moreover, Respondent

failed to immediately inform the Bureau in writing of a material change in the information that they provided in their application (i.e. mode of instruction).

SECOND CAUSE FOR DENIAL OF APPLICATION

(Deficient Descriptions of Educational Programs and/or Programs Do Not Meet Minimum Acceptable Standards)

- 37. Respondent's application is subject to denial under Code section 94891 and Regulation 71700, in conjunction with the following Codes and Regulations, as follows:
 - a. Respondent provided misleading information regarding the length of time required to learn a trade or skill, in violation of Code section 94897(c), in that syllabi submitted with the institution's application contain misleading information such as the syllabus for the Auto-Electric Tech program, which stated the program was 480 hours although it was approved by the Bureau for 600 hours.¹
 - b. Respondent failed to demonstrate its ability to achieve course objectives, in violation of Regulation 71710, subdivision (a), and Regulation 71715, subdivision (b), in that syllabi were inadequately organized or stated subject matter that did not make sense for the course. For example, the syllabus for Medical Assisting lists medical billing as a course objective but does not identify any lessons in medical billing. It also schedules the midterm after only 70 of 480 hours have been completed. Business Office Administration career objectives noted on the syllabus do not make sense for the course and do not obviously relate to the subject matter. Additionally, programs that combine other approved programs into a single program do not allot sufficient time to some course-critical objectives. For example, Electronics Tester includes 260 hours for Equipment Safety and Tool Use: Proper use of test equipment. But the Electronics Tester and Assembly Technician program only has 80 hours for this important subject. The same program objectives cannot be met given the dramatic reduction in required hours on the subject of safety and tool use.

¹ The institution did ultimately send a revised syllabus to the Bureau after three deficiency letters, indicating that the Auto-Tech program is 600 hours; however, it does not appear class instruction is actually taking place, as described below.

- c. The institution failed to communicate the intended career outcome of certain programs, in violation of Regulation 71475(t)(7). For example, the institution's catalog represented that at the completion of the Professional Child Care program, the student would have earned 16 Early Education Units. However the institution was approved to offer a 480-hour Professional Child Care program, not 16 units in Early Education. The description of the Professional Child Care program and earning Early Education units is unclear and misleading.
- d. The institution's catalog indicates that classes are provided in English and Spanish, and that distance education is offered, despite the fact that these methods of instruction were not approved by the Bureau and the institution did not apply in writing for permission to change the mode of instruction, in violation of Regulation 71600(a).
- e. The institution failed to comply with curricula requirements in violation of Regulation 71710, Regulation 71715(b), and Regulation 71475(u)(7), by failing to disclose curriculum creators and their qualifications; and by failing to provide curriculum for all education programs, including during an in-person visit to the institution's main campus by a Bureau representative on June 29, 2022. Owner Martha Zapien alternately stated it had been created, it was being created, and it would be created and later admitted the only documents available for review at the time were out of date (having been created decades before).
- f. The institution failed to maintain complete and accurate records of the educational programs offered by the institution and the curriculum for each program, a violation of Code section 94900.5.

THIRD CAUSE FOR DENIAL OF APPLICATION

(Merging of Classes)

38. Respondent's application is subject to denial under Code section 94891 and Regulation 71700, in conjunction with Code section 94898, subdivision (a) and Regulation 71710, subdivisions (a)(1) and (a)(2), in that the institution follows a "rolling admissions" model, allowing a new student to join any course on any given Monday. This is problematic as some

subject areas may be missed because of the "rolling start" model employed; additionally, numerous programs offered by the institution require a student to be exposed to foundational ideas that they then later build on; they cannot successfully begin a program many weeks into the established sequence of subjects and modules.

FOURTH CAUSE FOR DENIAL OF APPLICATION

(Untrue Statements Relating to Grades and Attendance)

Regulation 71700, in conjunction with Code section 94897, subdivision (j), in that student files reviewed on site indicate students maintained perfect attendance and earned A's in some programs despite classes not being offered. One student, M.G., posted attendance for June 29, 2022, even though the Bureau conducted an unannounced site visit this day and found the school to be closed. Despite the fact that some courses could not be offered either through direct instruction or online instruction due to COVID restrictions, lack of Bureau approval, and the program's being inappropriate for delivery through distance education methods, more than a dozen other students were enrolled and graduated even though it was impossible to deliver these programs in compliance with the law. The institution has either been offering numerous programs in an unapproved method of instruction (distance education), or the institution is failing to instruct students altogether.

FIFTH CAUSE FOR DENIAL OF APPLICATION

(Unauthorized Instruction in Languages Other than English)

40. Respondent's application is subject to denial under Code section 94891 and Regulation 71700, in conjunction with Regulations 71475(v) (regulating disclosures required if instruction in language other than English), 71600(a), and 71715(b), in that instruction is bilingual despite the fact that the Bureau has not approved this method of instruction, and it does not appear that all students are bilingual and therefore cannot benefit from portions of the instruction. Both the catalog and initial renewal application reference unapproved Spanish or bilingual instructions, and during the Bureau's unannounced inspection on June 29, 2022, Owner Zapien stated that instruction is bilingual, English and Spanish.

///

///

SIXTH CAUSE FOR DENIAL OF APPLICATION

(Failure to Provide Instruction and Show Faculty Qualifications)

41. Respondent's application is subject to denial Code section 94891 and Regulation 71700, in conjunction with Code section 94897(j)(2) and Regulations 71715(b)-(c), 71475(x) (requiring statement of compliance with Regulation 71720 in application), 71700, and 71720(b) (regulating faculty requirements), in that during an unannounced Bureau visit on June 29, 2022, approved direct instruction was not observed as occurring during scheduled class times. Furthermore, attendance records were provided which showed student M.G. as having attended class that day, despite the fact that the school was closed, no faculty was present, and classes were not being provided. Additionally, the institution has failed to provide evidence that some of the faculty identified on the institution's current class schedule are duly qualified and contracted to instruct, despite the Bureau's request to do so.

SEVENTH CAUSE FOR DENIAL OF APPLICATION

(Deficient Facilities and Equipment)

42. Respondent's application is subject to denial under Code section 94891 and Regulation 71700, in conjunction with Regulations 71735(a) and (b) (requiring equipment and facilities to be well-maintained), 71740(b) (requiring a library and other learning resources), and 71400.5 (misleading information in application is grounds for denial) in that many of the institution's classrooms failed to meet the regulatory standard of classrooms and campus environs being well-maintained. During the Bureau's June 29, 2022 visit, investigators found that more than half of the 13 classrooms noted in the catalog were not in useable condition, and the facilities were not "fully accessible to the disabled" as described in the catalog. Additionally, equipment identified by the institution in their application for renewal were not at the school during the Bureau's visit. This equipment included a library of children's books for the Professional Childcare program, a mannequin and wheelchair for the Medical Assistant program, and sewing machines for the Fashion Design and Sewing program.

EIGHTH CAUSE FOR DENIAL OF APPLICATION

(Lack of Recordkeeping; Custodian of Records)

43. Respondent's application is subject to denial under Code section 94891 and Regulation 71700, in conjunction with Code sections 94902(b)(1) (requiring School Performance Fact Sheet), 94910 (information required to be maintained in School Performance Fact Sheet), and 94897(k) (institution shall not conceal records), and Regulations 71930(a)&(e) (records shall be maintained and made available to the Bureau), 71475(dd)(1)&(2) (recordkeeping requirements), in that student files did not contain School Performance Fact Sheets. Additionally, during the Bureau's on site visit, the institution's owner attempted to conceal documents of record required to be maintained by refusing to show student files for students R.V. and M.R.G. to the Bureau investigator.

NINTH CAUSE FOR DENIAL OF APPLICATION

(The Institution Has Outstanding Fees)

44. Respondent's application is subject to denial under Code section 94891 and Regulation 71700, in conjunction with Code section 74000(d) (stating the Bureau shall deny an application if institution has outstanding fees) of the California Code of Regulations in that the institution owes the 2012 30-day penalty fee for the annual fee and the branch fee. The annual fee owed is \$82.50 and the branch fee owed is \$250.00.

19 ///

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

20 | ///

21 | ///

22 ///

23 ///

24 | ///

25 ///

26 | ///

27 | ///

28 ///

PRAYER 1 WHEREFORE, Complainant requests that a hearing be held on the matters herein alleged, 2 and that following the hearing, the Director of the Department of Consumer Affairs issue a 3 decision: 4 1. Denying the application of California Premiere College for Renewal of Approval to 5 Operate; and, 6 7 2. Taking such other and further action as deemed necessary and proper. 8 DATED: <u>6/2</u>/2023 "Original Signature on File" 9 DEBORAH COCHRANE 10 Chief Bureau for Private Postsecondary 11 Education Department of Consumer Affairs 12 State of California Complainant 13 14 SD2022802997/83865506.docx 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26 27 28 18