#### BEFORE THE DIRECTOR

#### **DEPARTMENT OF CONSUMER AFFAIRS**

#### **BUREAU FOR PRIVATE POSTSECONDARY EDUCATION**

#### STATE OF CALIFORNIA

In the Matter of the Accusation Against:

GILIGIA COLLEGE,

Respondent.

Case No. 999484

OAH No. 2019051059

#### **DECISION**

The attached Stipulated Settlement and Disciplinary Order is hereby adopted by the Director of the Department of Consumer Affairs as the Decision in the above entitled matter.

The Decision shall become effective

JAN 0 3 2020

DATED: November 28,201°

RYAN MARCROFT

Deputy Director, Legal Affairs

**Department of Consumer Affairs** 

		*				
1	XAVIER BECERRA					
2	Attorney General of California LINDA L. SUN					
3	Supervising Deputy Attorney General LISA A. MILLER					
	Deputy Attorney General					
4	State Bar No. 281374 300 So. Spring Street, Suite 1702					
5	Los Angeles, CA 90013 Telephone: (213) 269-6275					
6	Facsimile: (916) 731-2126 E-mail: Lisa.Miller@doj.ca.gov	,				
7	Attorneys for Complainant					
8	BEFOR	E THE				
9	DEPARTMENT OF CONSUMER AFFAIRS FOR THE BUREAU FOR PRIVATE POSTSECONDARY EDUCATION					
10	STATE OF CALIFORNIA					
11						
12						
13	In the Matter of the Accusation Against:	Case No. 999484				
14	GILIGIA COLLEGE	OAH No. 2019051059				
15	15C42 Cl	STIPULATED SETTLEMENT AND				
16	15643 Sherman Way, Suite 140 Van Nuys, CA 91406	DISCIPLINARY ORDER				
17	Approval to Operate No. 55199106					
18	Respondent.					
19 20						
20						
22	IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED AND AGR	EED by and between the parties to the above-				
23	entitled proceedings that the following matters are true:					
24	<u>PARTIES</u>					
25	1. Dr. Michael Marion, Jr. (Complainant) is the Chief of the Bureau for Private					
26	Postsecondary Education (Bureau). He brought this action solely in his official capacity and is					
	represented in this matter by Xavier Becerra, Atto	rney General of the State of California, by Lisa				
27	A. Miller, Deputy Attorney General.					
28						

- 2. Respondent Giligia College (Respondent) is represented in this proceeding by attorney Ron Talmo, Esq.
- 3. On or about February 22, 2007, the Bureau issued a temporary Approval to Operate No. 55199106 to Respondent. On January 3, 2011, a full Approval to Operate was granted. The full Approval to Operate expired on January 2, 2016.

#### **JURISDICTION**

- 4. Accusation No. 999484 was filed before the Director of the Department of Consumer Affairs and is currently pending against Respondent. The Accusation and all other statutorily required documents were properly served on Respondent on May 20, 2019. Respondent timely filed its Notice of Defense contesting the Accusation. Complainant served a First Amended Accusation on October 9, 2019
- 5. A copy of the First Amended Accusation No. 999484 is attached as Exhibit A and is incorporated herein by reference.

#### **ADVISEMENT AND WAIVERS**

- 6. Respondent has carefully read, fully discussed with counsel, and understands the charges and allegations in Accusation No. 999484. Respondent has also carefully read, fully discussed with counsel, and understands the effects of this Stipulated Settlement and Disciplinary Order.
- 7. Respondent is fully aware of its legal rights in this matter, including the right to a hearing on the charges and allegations in the Accusation; the right to confront and cross-examine the witnesses against them; the right to present evidence and to testify on its own behalf; the right to the issuance of subpoenas to compel the attendance of witnesses and the production of documents; the right to reconsideration and court review of an adverse decision; and all other rights accorded by the California Administrative Procedure Act and other applicable laws.
- 8. Respondent voluntarily, knowingly, and intelligently waives and gives up each and every right set forth above.

| | ///

28 | 7

#### **CULPABILITY**

- Respondent admits the truth of each and every charge and allegation in Accusation
   No. 999484.
- 10. Respondent agrees that its Approval to Operate is subject to discipline and they agree to be bound by the Director's probationary terms as set forth in the Disciplinary Order below.

#### **CONTINGENCY**

- 11. This stipulation shall be subject to approval by the Director of the Department of Consumer Affairs or the Director's designee. Respondent understands and agrees that counsel for Complainant and the staff of the Bureau for Private Postsecondary Education may communicate directly with the Director and staff of the Department of Consumer Affairs regarding this stipulation and settlement, without notice to or participation by Respondent or its counsel. By signing the stipulation, Respondent understands and agrees that they may not withdraw its agreement or seek to rescind the stipulation prior to the time the Director considers and acts upon it. If the Director fails to adopt this stipulation as the Decision and Order, the Stipulated Settlement and Disciplinary Order shall be of no force or effect, except for this paragraph, it shall be inadmissible in any legal action between the parties, and the Director shall not be disqualified from further action by having considered this matter.
- 12. The parties understand and agree that Portable Document Format (PDF) and facsimile copies of this Stipulated Settlement and Disciplinary Order, including PDF and facsimile signatures thereto, shall have the same force and effect as the originals.
- 13. This Stipulated Settlement and Disciplinary Order is intended by the parties to be an integrated writing representing the complete, final, and exclusive embodiment of their agreement. It supersedes any and all prior or contemporaneous agreements, understandings, discussions, negotiations, and commitments (written or oral). This Stipulated Settlement and Disciplinary Order may not be altered, amended, modified, supplemented, or otherwise changed except by a writing executed by an authorized representative of each of the parties.

///

14. In consideration of the foregoing admissions and stipulations, the parties agree that the Director may, without further notice or formal proceeding, issue and enter the following Disciplinary Order:

#### DISCIPLINARY ORDER

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that Approval to Operate No. 55199106, issued to Respondent Giligia College (Respondent), is revoked. However, the revocation is stayed and Respondent is placed on probation for five (5) years on the following terms and conditions:

OBEY ALL LAWS -- Respondent shall obey all federal, state and local laws and regulations governing the operation of a private postsecondary educational institution in California. Respondent shall submit, in writing, a full detailed account of any and all violations of the law to the Bureau for Private Postsecondary Education ("Bureau") within five (5) days of discovery.

Criminal Court Orders: If respondent is under criminal court orders, including probation or parole, and the order is violated, this shall be deemed a violation of these probation conditions, and may result in the filing of an Accusation and/or Petition to Revoke Probation.

- 2. COMPLIANCE WITH PROBATION AND QUARTERLY REPORTING -Respondent shall fully comply with the terms and conditions of probation established by the
  Bureau and shall cooperate with representatives of the Bureau in its monitoring and investigation
  of the respondent's compliance with probation. Respondent, within ten (10) days of completion of
  the quarter, shall submit quarterly written reports to the Bureau.
- 3. PERSONAL APPEARANCES -- Upon reasonable notice by the Bureau, respondent shall report to and make personal appearances at times and locations as the Bureau may direct.
- 4. NOTIFICATION OF ADDRESS AND TELEPHONE NUMBER CHANGE(S) —
  Respondent shall notify the Bureau, in writing, within five (5) days of a change of name, title,
  physical home address, email address, or telephone number of each person, as defined in section
  94855 of the Code, who owns or controls 25% or more of the stock or an interest in of the
  institution and, to the extent applicable, each general partner, officer, corporate director, corporate

member or any other person who exercises substantial control over the institution's management or policies.

- 5. NOTIFICATION TO PROSPECTIVE STUDENTS -- When currently soliciting or enrolling (or re-enrolling) a student for any program, respondent shall provide notification of this action to each current or prospective student prior to accepting their enrollment, and to those students who were enrolled at the time of the conduct that is the subject of this action as directed by the Bureau. This notification shall be in the form attached hereto as Exhibit B.
- 6. STUDENT ROSTER -- With 15 days of the effective date of this Decision, and with the Quarterly Reports thereafter, provide to the Bureau the names, addresses, and the programs in which they were enrolled, of all persons who were students of the institution within 60 days prior to the effective date of the Decision.
- 7. INSTRUCTION REQUIREMENTS AND LIMITATIONS -- During probation, Respondent shall provide approved instruction in the State of California. If respondent is not providing instruction, the period of probation shall be tolled during that time.
- 8. RECORD STORAGE -- Within 5 days of the effective date of this Decision, provide the Bureau with the location of the repository for all records as they are required to be maintained pursuant to Title 5, California Code of Regulations, section 71930.
- 9. MAINTENANCE OF CURRENT AND ACTIVE APPROVAL TO OPERATE -Respondent shall, at all times while on probation, maintain a current and valid approval to operate
  with the Bureau including any period during which approval is suspended or probation is tolled.
- COMPLY WITH CITATIONS -- Respondent shall comply with all final orders resulting from citations issued by the Bureau.
- 11. COST RECOVERY -- Respondent shall pay to the Bureau its costs of investigation and enforcement in the amount of \$16,303.29 no later than one year before the termination of probation. Such costs shall be payable to the Bureau and are to be paid regardless of whether the probation is tolled. Failure to pay such costs shall be considered a violation of probation.

Except as provided above, the Bureau shall not renew or reinstate the approval to operate of any respondent who has failed to pay all the costs as directed in a Decision.

- 12. VIOLATION OF PROBATION -- If respondent violates probation in any respect, the Bureau, after giving respondent notice and opportunity to be heard, may revoke probation and carry out the disciplinary order which was stayed. If an Accusation or a Petition to Revoke Probation is filed against respondent during probation, the Bureau shall have continuing jurisdiction until the matter is final, and the period of probation shall be extended, and respondent shall comply with all probation conditions, until the matter is final.
- 13. FUTURE APPROVALS TO OPERATE -- If respondent subsequently obtains other approvals to operate during the course of this probationary order, this Decision shall remain in full force and effect until the probationary period is successfully terminated. Future approvals shall not be granted, however, unless respondent is currently in compliance with all of the terms and conditions of probation.
- 14. COMPLY WITH ALL ACCREDITATION STANDARDS -- As applicable, respondent shall comply with all standards set by its accreditor in order to maintain its accreditation. Respondent shall submit to the Bureau, in writing, a full detailed account of any and all actions taken by any accrediting agency against respondent regarding any institution operated by respondent, including an order to show cause, or conditions or restrictions placed on accreditation, within five (5) days of occurrence.
- 15. COMPLETION OF PROBATION -- Upon successful completion of probation, respondent's approval to operate will be fully restored.
- days of the effective date of this decision, respondent shall amend its 2016 School/Student
  Performance Fact Sheet to reflect accurate information as required by section 94910 of the
  California Education Code, and provide the amended Fact Sheet to the Bureau for prior approval.
  Respondent shall also provide to the Bureau upon request verifiable documentation supporting
  the information contained on the Fact Sheet. Within 45 days of the effective date of this Decision,
  respondent shall provide the amended Fact Sheet as required by the California Private
  Postsecondary Education Act of 2009, as well as to all current and prospective students who

received the prior Fact Sheet. The amended School/Student Performance Fact Sheet shall contain a paragraph at the top containing the following disclosure:

"This amended School/Student Performance Fact Sheet replaces the Fact Sheet previously provided by this institution dated [date], and is being provided pursuant to a Decision and Order of the Department of Consumer Affairs. For more information, you may contact the [contact name] at the Bureau for Private Postsecondary Education at [phone number]."

17. OPERATIONS AUDITOR/BILLING AUDITOR -- Within 45 days of the effective date of this Decision, respondent shall submit to the Bureau for prior approval, the name and qualifications of an auditor who is experienced in operations or accounting practices for educational institutions, who has agreed to serve as an operations auditor/billing auditor. The auditor shall (1) be a California-licensed certified public accountant or public accountant with a clear and current license; and (2) have no prior or current business, professional, personal or other relationship with respondent.

Once approved, the auditor shall submit to the Bureau or its designee a plan by which respondent's operations shall be audited. Auditing shall consist of a least one hour per week of face-to-face meetings with respondent and shall continue during the entire probationary period. While such face-to-face meetings may include a director or employee of the institution not listed as having ownership or control, at least one person listed as having ownership or control shall participate in each such meeting. The respondent shall provide the auditor with a copy of this Decision and access to respondent's fiscal and/or student records. Respondent shall obtain any necessary student releases to enable the auditor to review records and to make direct contact with students. Respondent shall execute a release authorizing the auditor to divulge any information that the Bureau may request. It shall be respondent's responsibility to assure that the auditor submits written reports to the Bureau on a quarterly basis verifying that auditing has taken place and providing an evaluation of respondent's performance.

Respondent shall notify all current and potential students of any term or condition of probation that will affect the confidentiality of their records (such as this condition, which

requires an operations auditor/billing auditor). Such notifications shall be signed by each student prior to continuing or beginning enrollment.

If the auditor quits or is otherwise no longer available, respondent shall notify the Bureau within 10 days and get approval from the Bureau for a new auditor within 30 days. If no new auditor is approved within 30 days, respondent shall not operate until a new auditor has been approved by the Bureau. During this period of non-operation, probation will be tolled and will not commence again until the period of non-operation is completed. Respondent shall pay all costs associated with this auditing requirement. Failure to pay these costs shall be considered a violation of probation.

RECORDS MAINTENANCE -- With 45 days of the effective date of this Decision, provide for and secure a second set of all academic and financial records as required by Title 5, California Code of Regulations, section 71930, and provide to the Bureau the location of these records, and access to them upon request.

SEVERABILITY CLAUSE -- Each condition of probation contained herein is a separate and distinct condition. If any condition of this Order, or any application thereof, is declared unenforceable in whole, in part, or to any extent, the remainder of this Order, and all other applications thereof, shall not be affected. Each condition of this Order shall separately be valid and enforceable to the fullest extent permitted by law.

///

///

///

/// 26

/// 27

#### ACCEPTANCE 1 I have carefully read the above Stipulated Settlement and Disciplinary Order and have fully 2 discussed it with my attorney, Ron Talmo, Esq. 1 understand the stipulation and the effect it will 3 have on my Approval to Operate. I enter into this Stipulated Settlement and Disciplinary Order 4 voluntarily, knowingly, and intelligently, and agree to be bound by the Decision and Order of the 5 Director of the Department of Consumer Affairs. 6 7 8 9 GILIGIA, COLLEGE Respondent 10 I have read and fully discussed with Respondent, Giligia College, and Hovhanes 11 Kartounian, President, the terms and conditions and other matters contained in the above 12 Stipulated Settlement and Disciplinary Order. I approve its form and content. 13 14 DATED: 15 RON TALMO, ESQ. Attorney for Respondent 16 17 **ENDORSEMENT** 18 The foregoing Stipulated Settlement and Disciplinary Order is hereby respectfully 19 submitted for consideration by the Director of the Department of Consumer Affairs. 20 21 DATED: Respectfully submitted, 22 XAVIER BECERRA Attorney General of California 23 LINDA L. SUN Supervising Deputy Attorney General 24 25 LISA A. MILLER Deputy Attorney General 26 Attorneys for Complainant 27 LA2019600379 28 53844922,docx

#### **ACCEPTANCE** I have carefully read the above Stipulated Settlement and Disciplinary Order and have fully 2 discussed it with my attorney, Ron Talmo, Esq. I understand the stipulation and the effect it will 4 have on my Approval to Operate. I enter into this Stipulated Settlement and Disciplinary Order 5 voluntarily, knowingly, and intelligently, and agree to be bound by the Decision and Order of the Director of the Department of Consumer Affairs. 6 7 DATED: 8 HOVHANES KARTOUNIAN, President 9 GILIGIA COLLEGE Respondent 10 I have read and fully discussed with Respondent, Giligia College, and Hovhanes 11 Kartounian, President, the terms and conditions and other matters contained in the above 12 Stipulated Settlement and Disciplinary Order. I approve its form and content. 13 14 DATED: 10/25/19 15 RON TALMO, ESO. Attorney for Respondent 16 17 **ENDORSEMENT** 18 The foregoing Stipulated Settlement and Disciplinary Order is hereby respectfully 19 submitted for consideration by the Director of the Department of Consumer Affairs. 20 21 10/25/19 DATED: Respectfully submitted, 22 XAVIER BECERRA Attorney General of California 23 LINDA L. SUN Supervising Deputy Attorney General 24 25 LISA A. MILLER Deputy Attorney General 26 Attorneys for Complainant

1

3

27

28

LA2019600379

53844922.docx

Exhibit A

Accusation No. 999484

1	Xavier Becerra					
2	Attorney General of California LINDA L. SUN					
3	Supervising Deputy Attorney General LISA A. MILLER					
	Deputy Attorney General					
4	State Bar No. 281374 300 So. Spring Street, Suite 1702					
5	Los Angeles, CA 90013 Telephone: (213) 269-6275					
6	Facsimile: (213) 897-2804					
7	E-mail: Lisa Miller@doj.ca.gov  Attorneys for Complainant					
8						
9	BEFORE THE					
	DEPARTMENT OF CONSUMER AFFAIRS FOR THE BUREAU FOR PRIVATE POSTSECONDARY EDUCATION					
10	STATE OF CALIFORNIA					
11						
12	,					
13	× 11 3 5 11 11 11 11 11 11 11 11 11 11 11 11 1					
14	In the Matter of the First Amended Accusation Against:	Case No. 999484				
15	GILIGIA COLLEGE	THE COLUMN A COLUMN A				
16	15643 Sherman Way, Suite 140 Van Nuys, CA 91406	FIRST AMENDED ACCUSATION				
17	Institution Code: 55199106					
18	-					
19	Respondent.	,				
20		·				
21						
22	Complainant alleges:					
23	PARTIES					
24	1. Dr. Michael Marion, Jr. ("Complainant") brings this First Amended Accusation					
25	solely in his official capacity as the Chief of the Bureau for Private Postsecondary Education,					
26	Department of Consumer Affairs.					
27	<i>III</i>					
28						
40	<i>"</i> :					
1		1				

2. On or about February 22, 2007, the Bureau for Private Postsecondary Education ("Bureau") issued Institution Code 55199106 to Giligia College ("Respondent" or "Giligia"). The renewal of the Approval to Operate was denied on November 16, 2017, and the appeal is pending.

#### **JURISDICTION**

3. This First Amended Accusation is brought before the Director of the Department of Consumer Affairs ("Director") for the Bureau under the authority of the following laws. All section references are to the California Education Code unless otherwise indicated.

#### STATUTORY PROVISIONS<sup>1</sup>

- 4. Section 94877 of the Code states:
- "(a) The bureau shall adopt and shall enforce regulations to implement this chapter pursuant to the Administrative Procedure Act (Chapter 3.5 (commencing with Section 11340) of Part 1 of Division 3 of Title 2 of the Government Code).
- (b) The bureau shall develop and implement an enforcement program, pursuant to Article 18 (commencing with Section 94932) to implement this chapter. The enforcement program shall include a plan for investigating complaints filed with the bureau. The bureau shall contract with the office of the Attorney General, or other appropriate state agency, to establish a process for the bureau's staff to be trained to investigate complaints, including, but not limited to, the information, evidence, and materials needed to process complaints.
- (c) The bureau shall institute training to ensure that its staff are equipped to review and verify the accuracy of the data contained in consumer disclosures, including, but not limited to, the School Performance Fact Sheet.
- (d) The bureau shall establish a program to proactively identify unlicensed institutions, identify material or repeated violations of this chapter and regulations implementing this chapter, and take all appropriate legal action."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> On October 11, 2009, the California Private Postsecondary Education Act of 2009 was signed into law. (Educ. Code, §§ 94800, et seq.) The Act was recently amended, effective January 1, 2019.

<ol><li>Section 94897 of the Co.</li></ol>	ЭŤ	94897	Section	5.
--	----	-------	---------	----

"An institution shall not do any of the following:

"(g) Offer to compensate a student to act as an agent of the institution with regard to the solicitation, referral, or recruitment of any person for enrollment in the institution, except that an institution may award a token gift to a student for referring an individual, provided that the gift is not in the form of money, no more than one gift is provided annually to a student, and the gift's cost is not more than one hundred dollars (\$100).

12

14

18

24

25 26

27 28

"(j) In any manner make an untrue or misleading change in, or untrue or misleading statement related to, a test score, grade or record of grades, attendance record, record indicating student completion, placement, employment, salaries, or financial information, including any of the following:

- "(1) A financial report filed with the bureau.
- "(2) Information or records relating to the student's eligibility for student financial aid at the institution.
  - "(3) Any other record or document required by this chapter or by the bureau.
- "(k) Willfully falsify, destroy, or conceal any document of record while that document of record is required to be maintained by this chapter.
  - Section 94899 of the Code states:

"If an institution offers an educational program in a profession, occupation, trade, or career field that requires licensure in this state, the institution shall have an educational program approval from the appropriate state licensing agency to conduct that educational program in order that a student who completes the educational program, except as provided in Section 94905, is eligible to sit for any required licensure examination."

- Section 94901 of the Education Code states in relevant part:
- "(a) An institution's recruiters shall be employees.

- (b) (1) An institution shall issue identification to each recruiter identifying the recruiter and the institution.
  - (2) The recruiter shall have the issued identification with him or her while recruiting."
  - 8. Section 94902 of the Education Code states in relevant part:
- "(a) A student shall enroll solely by means of executing an enrollment agreement. The enrollment agreement shall be signed by the student and by an authorized employee of the institution.
- (b) An enrollment agreement is not enforceable unless all of the following requirements are met:
- (1) The student has received the institution's catalog and School Performance Fact Sheet prior to signing the enrollment agreement.
- (3) Prior to the execution of the enrollment agreement, the student and the institution have signed and dated the information required to be disclosed in the Student Performance Fact Sheet pursuant to subdivisions (a) to (d), inclusive, of Section 94910. Each of these items in the Student Performance Fact Sheet shall include a line for the student to initial and shall be initialed and dated by the student."
  - 9. Section 94905 of the Education Code states:
- "(a) During the enrollment process, an institution offering educational programs designed to lead to positions in a profession, occupation, trade, or career field requiring licensure in this state shall exercise reasonable care to determine if the student will not be eligible to obtain licensure in the profession, occupation, trade, or career field at the time of the student's graduation and shall provide all students enrolled in those programs with a written copy of the requirements for licensure established by the state, including any applicable course requirements established by the state. If the minimum course requirements of the institution exceed the minimum requirements for state licensure, the institution shall disclose this information, including a list of those courses that are not required for state licensure. The institution shall not execute an enrollment agreement

with a student that is known to be ineligible for licensure, unless the student's stated objective is other than licensure.

- (b) During the enrollment process, an institution may discuss internships and student jobs available to the student during the student's attendance at the institution. If the institution discusses internships and student jobs, the institution shall disclose the number of requests for internship and student job placement assistance received by the institution during the immediately preceding calendar year and the number of actual placements during that year.
- (c) During the enrollment process, an institution offering educational programs designed to lead to positions in a profession, occupation, trade, or career field where voluntary licensure by a government agency is available, shall provide its students seeking to enroll in those programs with a written copy of the requirements for that voluntary licensure."
  - 10. Section 94909 of the Education Code states in relevant part:
- "(a) Except as provided in subdivision (d), prior to enrollment, an institution shall provide a prospective student, either in writing or electronically, with a school catalog containing, at a minimum, all of the following:

(3) The following statements:

(5) And Ione Wing Buttoments

- (B) 'As a prospective student, you are encouraged to review this catalog prior to signing an enrollment agreement. You are also encouraged to review the School Performance Fact Sheet, which must be provided to you prior to signing an enrollment agreement."
  - 11. Section 94912 of the Education Code states:

"Prior to the execution of an enrollment agreement, the information required to be disclosed pursuant to subdivisions (a) to (d), inclusive, of Section 94910 shall be signed and dated by the institution and the student. Each of these items shall also be initialed and dated by the student."

| //

27 | /

26.

28 | /

10	C L!	04010	- C 11	T7 1 1'	Code states	
	Section	944	OT THE	FIGURATION	Date of all a	٠.

- "(a) An institution that participates in the federal student financial aid programs complies with this article by complying with applicable regulations of the federal student financial aid programs under Title IV of the federal Higher Education Act of 1965.
- "(b) The institution shall advise each student that a notice of cancellation shall be in writing, and that a withdrawal may be effectuated by the student's written notice or by the student's conduct, including, but not necessarily limited to, a student's lack of attendance.
- "(c) The institution shall also provide a pro rata refund of nonfederal student financial aid program moneys paid for institutional charges to students who have completed 60 percent or less of the period of attendance.
- "(d) Institutions shall refund 100 percent of the amount paid for institutional charges, less a reasonable deposit or application fee not to exceed two hundred fifty dollars (\$250), if notice of cancellation is made through attendance at the first class session, or the seventh day after enrollment, whichever is later."
  - 13. Section 94920 of the Code states in relevant part:

"An institution that does not participate in the federal student financial aid programs shall do all of the following:

.

"(d) The institution shall have a refund policy for the return of unearned institutional charges if the student cancels an enrollment agreement or withdraws during a period of attendance. The refund policy for students who have completed 60 percent or less of the period of attendance shall be a pro rata refund.

#### 14. Section 94921 of the Code states:

"An institution offering an educational program for which the refund calculations set forth in this article cannot be utilized because of the unique way in which the educational program is structured, may petition the bureau for an alternative method of calculating tuition refunds,"

| | ///

- 15. Section 94929.7 of the Education Code states in relevant part:
- "(a) The information used to substantiate the rates and information calculated pursuant to Sections 94929 and 94929.5 shall do both of the following:
- (1) Be documented and maintained by the institution for five years from the date of the publication of the rates and information,
  - (2) Be retained in an electronic format and made available to the bureau upon request.
- (b) An institution shall provide a list of employment positions used to determine the number of graduates employed in the field for purposes of calculating job placement rates pursuant to this article."

#### REGULATORY PROVISIONS

16. California Code of Regulations, title 5, section 71660 states:

"An institution shall notify the Bureau of a non-substantive change including: change of location of less than 10 miles; addition of a program related to the approved programs offered by the institution; addition of a new branch five miles or less from the main or branch campus; addition of a satellite; and change of mailing address. All such notifications shall be made within 30 days of the change and sent to the Bureau, in writing, to the address listed in section 70020."

- 17. California Code of Regulations, title 5, section 71750 states in relevant part:
- "(c) A pro rata refund pursuant to section 94919(c) or 94920(d) or 94927 of the Code shall be no less than the total amount owed by the student for the portion of the educational program provided subtracted from the amount paid by the student, calculated as follows:
- (1) The amount owed equals the daily charge for the program (total institutional charge, divided by the number of days or hours in the program), multiplied by the number of days student attended, or was scheduled to attend, prior to withdrawal.
- (2) Except as provided for in subdivision (a)(3) of this section, all amounts paid by the student in excess of what is owed as calculated in subdivision (a)(1) shall be refunded.
- (3) Except as provided herein, all amounts that the student has paid shall be subject to refund unless the enrollment agreement and the refund policy outlined in the catalog specify amounts paid for an application fee or deposit not more than \$250.00, books, supplies, or

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

- (1) Written records and transcripts of any formal education or training, testing, or experience that are relevant to the student's qualifications for admission to the institution or the institution's award of credit or acceptance of transfer credits including the following:
- (A) Verification of high school completion or equivalency or other documentation establishing the student's ability to do college level work, such as successful completion of an ability-to-benefit test;
- (3) Copies of all documents signed by the student, including contracts, instruments of indebtedness, and documents relating to financial aid;
- (4) Records of the dates of enrollment and, if applicable, withdrawal from the institution, leaves of absence, and graduation; and
- (5) In addition to the requirements of section 94900(b) of the Code, a transcript showing all of the following:
- (A) The courses or other educational programs that were completed, or were attempted but not completed, and the dates of completion or withdrawal;
- (9) A document showing the total amount of money received from or on behalf of the student and the date or dates on which the money was received;
- (10) A document specifying the amount of a refund, including the amount refunded for tuition and the amount for other itemized charges, the method of calculating the refund, the date the refund was made, and the name and address of the person or entity to which the refund was sent;".
  - 21. California Code of Regulations, title 5, section 71930 states in relevant part:
- "(d) The institution shall maintain a second set of all academic and financial records required by the Act and this chapter at a different location unless the original records, including records stored pursuant to subdivision (b) of this section, are maintained in a manner secure from damage or loss. An acceptable manner of storage under this subsection would include fire resistant cabinets.
- (e) All records that the institution is required to maintain by the Act or this chapter shall be made immediately available by the institution for inspection and copying during normal business hours by the Bureau and any entity authorized to conduct investigations."

22. California Code of Regulations, title 5, section 74112 states in relevant part:

"(f) Total Charges. The institution's Annual Report and Performance Fact Sheet shall include the total charges for a student to complete the program within 100% of the program length. The institution must include the disclosure that there may be additional charges if the program is not completed on-time.

Total charges shall be disclosed in the Performance Fact Sheet in a format substantially similar to the format listed below (dates and numbers are for example only):

#### Cost of Educational Program:

Total Charges for the program for students completing on-time in 20XX: \$50,000.

Total Charges may be higher for students that do not complete on-time.

Student's Initials:	Date:	 ,
In a de market in white army to a	 	 

Initial only after you have had sufficient time to read and understand the information.

(m) Documentation supporting all data reported shall be maintained electronically by the institution for at least five years from the last time the data was included in either an Annual Report or a Performance Fact Sheet and shall be provided to the Bureau upon request; the data for each program shall include at a minimum:

- (1) the list of job classifications determined to be considered gainful employment for the educational program;
- (2) student name(s), address, phone number, email address, program completed, program start date, scheduled completion date, and actual completion date;
- (3) graduate's place of employment and position, date employment began, date employment ended, if applicable, actual salary, hours per week, and the date employment was verified;
- (4) for each employer from which employment or salary information was obtained, the employer name(s) address and general phone number, the contact person at the employer and the contact's phone number and email address, and all written communication with employer verifying student's employment or salary;

 Professions Code but that an institution shall not be required to pay the cost of investigation to more than one agency.

#### FACTUAL BACKGROUND

- 26. On or about February 26, 2014, the Bureau received an enforcement referral from a Bureau Compliance Analyst. The referral resulted from Respondent's failure to clear all items on a Notice to Comply following the Bureau's announced compliance inspection of Respondent. Subsequent to the Bureau analyst's referral, the Bureau received two additional complaints against Respondent.
- 27. The second complaint was received by the Bureau on or about July 12, 2017. It was filed by a former student, K.T. The complaint alleged the following: (1) K.T. was enrolled in Respondent's Medical Billing Program and the program was more focused on medical coding than medical billing; (2) Respondent encouraged K.T. to falsify information on his job applications; (3) Respondent promised to, but did not assist K.T. in his job search; (4) K.T. was not taught enough during the Medical Billing Program to pass the certification test; (5) Respondent provided K.T. with a Toshiba Windows 8 laptop, valued in excess of \$100, in return for recruiting students for a CPR class being offered at Giligia.
- 28. On October 24, 2017, a Bureau Compliance Analyst submitted a referral. The referral resulted from a review of the documents submitted by Respondent during a Bureau desk inspection. The review showed that Respondent had violated regulations related to Uniform Data Annual Reports, Performance Fact Sheets, record keeping requirements, and prohibited business practices.
- 29. On October 27, 2017, the Bureau notified Respondent that their application for a Renewal for Approval to Operate and Offer Education Programs for Non-Accredited Institutions in California was denied.<sup>2</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> A Statement of Issues, Bureau Case No. 1003079 was filed on May 21, 2018 in this related matter. The OAH Number for the Statement of Issues matter is 2018060904. The hearing for this matter is set for June 27, 2019.

30. On May 17, 2018, a Bureau investigator traveled to Giligia to conduct a field investigation based on the three complaints. In the course of the investigation, the investigator collected and copied many documents, including but not limited to student files, Respondent's Catalog, and the Student Handbook. The investigator determined that Respondent is in violation of sections of the Code and the California Code of Regulations, set forth in greater detail below.

#### FIRST CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

#### (Notifications of Non-Substantive Changes)

31. Respondent is subject to disciplinary action under Code section 94877, subdivision

(a) in conjunction with Title 5 of the California Code of Regulations, section 71660, in that

Respondent offered a Cardiopulmonary Resuscitation ("CPR") program to its students without

notifying the Bureau of the addition to Respondent's roster of programs. This course is not

offered in Respondent's Catalog. The Bureau investigator researched the Bureau's database,

School Automated Information Link ("SAIL"). The investigator determined that CPR is not, nor

has it ever been, an approved program offered by Respondent. Complaint refers to, and by this

reference incorporates paragraphs 26 through 30 as though set forth in full.

#### SECOND CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

#### (Withdrawals and Refunds)

- 32. Respondent is subject to disciplinary action under Code sections 94877, subdivision (a) in conjunction with Title 5 of the California Code of Regulations, section 71750, subdivisions (c) and (f), and Code section 94920, subdivision (d) in that Respondent failed to comply with requirements relating to the issuance of refunds. On or about May 17, 2018, the Bureau investigator obtained five random student files as well as the 2018 Giligia catalog, the 2018 Student Handbook, and the current version of Respondent's enrollment agreement. Respondent's failure to comply with requirements relating to refunds and withdrawals are set forth in greater detail below:
- i. The documents revealed that Respondent's refund policy does not meet the requirements that there be a specific pro rata refund for students who attend less than 60 percent of the program period of attendance. Instead, Respondent calculates refunds based on the length

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

## 

# 4 5

## 

## 

## 

## 

## 

#### 

#### 

#### 

#### 

#### 

## 

#### 

#### 

## 

### 

## 

### 

#### 

## 

### 

#### FOURTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

#### (Catalog)

- 34. Respondent is subject to disciplinary action under Code section 94877, subdivision
  (a) in conjunction with Title 5 of the California Code of Regulations, section 71810, subdivisions
  (b)(7) and (b)(14), in that Respondent's Catalog has the following deficiencies:
- i. Respondent's catalog does not state whether the institution accepts experiential learning credit and does not have policies or procedures as required to address the topic.
- ii. Respondent's catalog does not contain a policy for addressing student grievances or student rights as required. The catalog's only grievance policy is for faculty and employees.

Complaint refers to, and by this reference incorporates paragraphs 26 through 30 as though set forth in full.

#### FIFTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

#### (Student Records)

- 35. Respondent is subject to disciplinary action under Code section 94877, subdivision
  (a) in conjunction with Title 5 of the California Code of Regulations, section 71920, subdivisions
  (b)(1)(A), (b)(3), (b)(4), (b)(5)(A), (b)(9), and (b)(10), in that Respondent failed to maintain student records as follows:
- i. Respondent failed to maintain verification within its student files of students'
   completion of high school or the equivalent, or documentation establishing the student's ability to
   do college-level work, such as an ability to benefit test;
- ii. Respondent failed to retain all documentation signed by students, including School Performance Fact Sheets ("SPFS"), attendance forms, as well as financial forms;
- iii. Respondent failed to maintain the required documentation regarding students' attendance in or withdrawals from its respective programs;
  - iv. Respondent failed to maintain student transcripts;
- v. Respondent failed to maintain ledgers of students' accounts. Respondent also had incomplete billing statements for students, which in several instances, contradict the tuition amounts listed on the enrollment agreements.

vi. Respondent's files pertaining to student withdrawal were incomplete and did not contain all the required calculation information or required refund amounts.

Complaint refers to, and by this reference incorporates paragraphs 26 through 30 as though set forth in full.

#### SIXTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

#### (Maintenance of Records)

36. Respondent is subject to disciplinary action under Code section 94877, subdivision (a) in conjunction with Title 5 of the California Code of Regulations, section 71930, subdivisions (d) and (e), in that Respondent failed to maintain a second set of academic and financial records and to make those records available for inspection and copying by the Bureau or other authorized investigative entities. On or about October 8, 2018, the Bureau investigator requested the following documentation from Respondent: Student Tuition Recovery Fund ("STRF") and SPFS backup data for 2016, 2017, and 2018; a copy of the 2016 SPFS; faculty files for Giligia instructors U.B., N.M., R.B., R.M., S.R., P.B., and T.H. Respondent has not provided the requested documentation to the Bureau. Complaint refers to, and by this reference incorporates paragraphs 26 through 30 as though set forth in full.

#### SEVENTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

#### (Uniform Data - Annual Report, Performance Fact Sheet)

37. Respondent is subject to disciplinary action under Code section 94877, subdivision (a) in conjunction with Title 5 of the California Code of Regulations, section 74112, subdivisions (f) and (m)(1) through (7), in that Respondent's Annual Report and Performance Fact Sheet did not include the total charges for a student to complete a program. Additionally, Respondent failed to provide the Bureau with the data reported in the Annual Report and Performance Fact Sheet, including but not limited to the following: student names and contact information; graduates' place of employment and employment information; data regarding license examination and examination results, and descriptions of all attempts to contact students and/or employers. Complaint refers to, and by this reference incorporates paragraphs 26 through 30 as though set forth in full.

# 

7 8

#### EIGHTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

(Record Keeping Requirements)

- 38. Respondent is subject to disciplinary action under Code section 94877, subdivision (a) in conjunction with Title 5 of the California Code of Regulations, section 76140, subdivisions (a)(1), (a)(3), (a)(7), (a)(8), (a)(11), (a)(12) and (a)(13), in that Respondent was required to collect and maintain records of student information to substantiate the data reported on the STRF Assessment Reporting Form and records of the students' eligibility under the fund, specifically, the students' identification numbers, email addresses, course information and cost, date of signature for enrollment agreements, third party payer information, and total institutional charges, as set forth below:
- i. Respondent failed to include student identification numbers on many of the files collected by the Bureau investigator at Giligia on or about May 17, 2018;
- Respondent provided invalid/nonworking student email addresses to the Bureau on May 17 and 30, 2018.
- iii. Multiple enrollment agreements collected by the Bureau were not signed and/or dated by the student or Respondent's administrator.
- iv. During the Bureau investigator's May 17, 2018 visit, many of the student files collected list conflicting course costs and content of the courses. Furthermore, the course tuition as listed on the enrollment agreements does not match the tuition as listed in the catalog that was current at the time of the student enrollment.
- v. Respondent's owner, Hovanes Kartounian, informed the Bureau investigator during the May 17, 2018 site visit, that Respondent gets the majority of its students through back-to-work programs, which are funded by third-party payers. None of the files obtained by the Bureau on May 17, 31, and June 6, 2018, contained the full documentation showing the payments, interactions, and contact between Respondent and the third-party payers.
- vi. Respondent failed to include financial ledgers in the students' files, as well as the exact amounts billed for each student's tuition, or the exact amount paid for each student's tuition.

Complaint refers to, and by this reference incorporates paragraphs 26 through 30 as though set forth in full.

#### **NINTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE**

#### (Prohibited Business Practices)

- 39. Respondent is subject to disciplinary action under section 94897, subdivisions (g), (j)(3) and (k), of the Code in that Respondent engaged in prohibited business practices as follows:
- i. Respondent employed student K.T. to recruit fellow students for a CPR course that Respondent offered as part of its medical billing program. Respondent paid student K.T. for his recruitment efforts by giving him a Toshiba laptop with Windows 8 installed. The value of the laptop exceeded \$100.
- ii. During the May 17, 2018 field investigation, the Bureau investigator found documents that indicate that Respondent had falsified student files, stating that the students had fulfilled the requirements of their course of study. The student files show that that at least one student did not complete the required number of course hours and should have not have graduated from their program. Student S.T. received a Certificate of Completion for the Respondent's Taxation program on April 14, 2017. However, student S.T.'s Transcript of Academic Record states that S.T. only completed 17 of the 20 units required to graduate.
- iii. The student files collected and copied by the Bureau investigator during the May 17, 2018 field investigation, when contrasted with documents supplied by Respondent on May 31, 2018 and June 6, 2018, indicate that Respondent falsified and altered the student files by adding signature and/or changing students' dates of attendance for their programs. Respondent's records reflect that student L.M. completed the 20-unit Medical Billing program on February 23, 2018. This program requires completion of 415 hours of coursework. During the May 17, 2018 field investigation, the Bureau investigator made copies of student L.M.'s student file. The daily attendance sheet copied by the investigator contained an attendance record showing L.M.'s attendance on the following dates only: October 2-6, 2017. Respondent emailed additional documents to the Bureau investigator on May 31, 2018. These additional documents included documents from L.M.'s student file that were missing during the May 17, 2018 field

investigation, including the Transcript Academic Record, as well as attendance records that contained L.M.'s purported signature on all six pages of the attendance record, from October 2, 2017 through February 23, 2018.

Complaint refers to, and by this reference incorporates paragraphs 26 through 30 as though set forth in full.

#### TENTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

#### (Approval Required for Programs Lending to Licensed Professions)

40. Respondent is subject to disciplinary action under sections 94899 and 94905 of the Code, in that Respondent offered a Pharmacy Technician program in 2016 without agency approval and failed to inform the students that this licensure was required for this profession. Respondent did not provide information on the licensing requirements or examination as required. Complaint refers to, and by this reference incorporates paragraphs 26 through 30 as though set forth in full.

#### **ELEVENTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE**

#### (Requirements for Recruiters)

41. Respondent is subject to disciplinary action under section 94901 of the Code, in that Respondent asked student K.T. to recruit new students for Respondent's CPR program. Respondent did not issue student K.T. with identification to carry with in him while acting in the role of recruiter. Complainant refers to, and by this reference incorporates paragraph 26 through 30 as though set forth in full.

#### TWELFTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

#### (General Enrollment Requirements)

42. Respondent is subject to disciplinary action under section 94902, subdivisions (a), (b)(1) and (b)(3) of the Code, in that Respondent failed to provide all students with copies of the Catalog and SPFS. In addition, during the May 17, 2018 field investigation, the Bureau investigator collected and copied student files, many of which are missing signed copies of the SPFS. Complaint refers to, and by this reference incorporates paragraphs 26 through 30 as though set forth in full.

1

2

## 5

#### 6

#### 7

## 8

## 9

#### 10

#### 11

#### 12

## 13

#### 14

#### 15

#### 16

#### 17

#### 18

#### 19

#### 20

#### 21

## 22

### 23 24

#### 25

### 26 27

## 28

#### THIRTEENTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

#### (Minimum Requirements for School Catalog)

- Respondent is subject to disciplinary action under section 94909, subdivisions (a)(3) (B) of the Code, in that Respondent was required to include required statements in the school catalog pertaining to review of the catalogue and SPFS. Respondent failed to include the following required statement:
- "(a) Except as provided in subdivision (d), prior to enrollment, an institution shall provide a prospective student, either in writing or electronically, with a school catalog containing, at a minimum, all of the following:
  - (3) The following statements:
- (B) 'As a prospective student, you are encouraged to review this catalog prior to signing an enrollment agreement. You are also encouraged to review the School Performance Fact Sheet, which must be provided to you prior to signing an enrollment agreement.

Complaint refers to, and by this reference incorporates paragraphs 26 through 30 as though set forth in full.

#### FOURTEENTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

#### (Signature, Initials Required)

44. Respondent is subject to disciplinary action under section 94912 of the Code in that Respondent was required to have its students sign, date, and initial various parts of the Enrollment Agreement. In the course of the May 17, 2018 field investigation, the Bureau investigator obtained multiple student files which were not properly signed by both the students and Respondent. Complaint refers to, and by this reference incorporates paragraphs 26 through 30 as though set forth in full.

#### FIFTEENTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

#### (Institution Participating in Federal Student Financial Aid Programs)

Respondent is subject to disciplinary action under section 94919 of the Code, in that Respondent is an institution that participates in the federal student financial aid program and is therefore required to issue pro rata refunds of nonfederal student financial aid program moneys paid for institutional charges to students who have completed 60 percent or less of the period of

attendance. However, Respondent's refund policy does not meet the requirement as it calculates refunds based on the length of time, for example, refunding students who attend 10 percent of their program at least 90 percent of the fees, while students who attend between 10 and 25 percent are refunded 25 percent of the fees. Complaint refers to, and by this reference incorporates paragraphs 26 through 30 as though set forth in full.

#### SIXTEENTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

#### (Alternative Refund Calculation)

46. Respondent is subject to disciplinary action under section 94921 of the Code in that Respondent was required to obtain approval from the Bureau before implementing an alternative method of calculating student refunds and failed to do so. Complaint refers to, and by this reference incorporates paragraphs 26 through 30 as though set forth in full.

#### SEVENTEENTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

#### (Documentation of Performance Data)

47. Respondent is subject to disciplinary action under section 94929.7, subdivisions (a)(1), (a)(2) and (b), of the Code in that Respondent is required to document and retain the information used to substantiate and calculate the completion rate for each program, as well as the job placement rate, license examination passage rate, salary and wage information of graduates, three-year cohort federal loan default rate. Respondent is also required to document and retain information. On or about October 18, 2018, the Bureau requested the above information from Respondent, who failed to provide the requested information. Furthermore, on the same date, the Bureau requested additional information, including a list of employment positions use to determine the number of graduates employed in the field for purposes of calculating job placement rates. Respondent failed to provide the information. Complaint refers to, and by this reference incorporates paragraphs 26 through 30 as though set forth in full.

#### PRAYER

WHEREFORE, Complainant requests that a hearing be held on the matters herein alleged, and that following the hearing, the Director of the Department of Consumer Affairs issue a decision:

Exhibit B

**Notice of Probation** 

#### NOTICE OF PROBATION

Dear Student/Prospective Student:

Please be advised that Giligia College's license to operate in the State of California is currently on probation by the Bureau for Private Postsecondary Education as a result of the Decision and Order in Case No. 999484. To view a copy of the Accusation against Giligia College and the Stipulated Settlement in Case No. 999484, please go to the link below.

www.bppe.ca.gov/enforcement/disciplinary\_actions.shtml#d

Sincerely,

Giligia College