1							
1	XAVIER BECERRA						
2	Attorney General of California MARC D. GREENBAUM						
3	Supervising Deputy Attorney General GILLIAN E. FRIEDMAN						
4	Deputy Attorney General State Bar No. 169207						
5	300 So. Spring Street, Suite 1702 Los Angeles, CA 90013						
6	Telephone: (213) 269-6294 Facsimile: (213) 897-2804						
7	Attorneys for Complainant						
8	BEFOR	E THE					
9	DEPARTMENT OF C FOR THE BUREAU FOR PRIVATE						
10	STATE OF C						
11		1					
12	In the Matter of the Statement of Issues Against:	Case No. 1003430					
13 14	AVID CAREER COLLEGE, MANLI YU, OWNER	STATEMENT OF ISSUES					
15	Application for Renewal of Approval to Operate an Institution Non-Accredited						
16	Institution Code: 1941551						
17	Respondent.						
18							
19							
20	Complainant alleges:						
21	PAR'	FIFC					
22		t) brings this Statement of Issues solely in his					
23							
24	official capacity as the Chief of the Bureau for Pr	ivate Postsecondary Education, Department of					
25	Consumer Affairs.						
26		for Private Postsecondary Education received					
27	an Application for Renewal of Approval to Opera						
28	Career College, Manli Yu (Respondent). On or a	bout May 1, 2014, Manli Yu certified under					

penalty of perjury to the truthfulness of all statements, answers, and representations in the application. The Bureau denied the application on February 23, 2018.

JURISDICTION

3. This Statement of Issues is brought before the Director of the Department of Consumer Affairs (Director) for the Bureau for Private Postsecondary Education, under the authority of the following laws. All section references are to the Education Code unless otherwise indicated.

STATUTORY PROVISIONS

- 4. Business and Professions Code of 22 defines the term "board" to include "bureau."
- 5. Education Code section 94885¹ states:
- 6. Education Code Section 94891 subdivision (b) states:

To be granted a renewal of an approval to operate, the institution shall demonstrate its continued capacity to meet the minimum operating standards.

7. Education Code Section 94894 states in pertinent part:

The following changes to an approval to operate are considered substantive changes and require prior authorization:

(a) A change in educational objectives, including an addition of a new diploma or a degree educational program unrelated to the approved educational programs offered by the institution.

.

- 8. Education Code Section 94906 states:
- (a) An enrollment agreement shall be written in language that is easily understood. If English is not the student's primary language, and the student is unable to understand the terms and conditions of the enrollment agreement, the student shall have the right to obtain a clear explanation of the terms and conditions and all cancellation and refund policies in his or her primary language.

///

¹ California Private Postsecondary Education Act of 2009, Ed. Code §§ 94800 et seq.

The transferability of credits you earn at (name of institution) is at the complete discretion of an institution to which you may seek to transfer. Acceptance of the (degree, diploma, or certificate) you earn in (name of educational program) is also at the complete discretion of the institution to which you may seek to transfer. If the (credits or degree, diploma, or certificate) that you earn at this institution are not accepted at the institution to which you seek to transfer, you may be required to repeat some or all of your coursework at that institution. For this reason you should make certain that your attendance at this institution will meet your educational goals. This may include contacting an institution to which you may seek to transfer after attending (name of institution) to determine if your (credits or degree, diploma, or certificate) will transfer.

- (16) A statement specifying whether the institution, or any of its degree programs, are accredited by an accrediting agency recognized by the United States Department of Education. If the institution is unaccredited and offers an associate, baccalaureate, master's, or doctoral degree, or is accredited and offers an unaccredited program for an associate, baccalaureate, master's, or doctoral degree, the statement shall disclose the known limitations of the degree program, including, but not limited to, all of the following:
- (A) Whether a graduate of the degree program will be eligible to sit for the applicable licensure exam in California and other states or become certified or registered as required for the applicable profession, occupation, trade, or career field in California.
- (B) A degree program that is unaccredited or a degree from an unaccredited institution is not recognized for some employment positions, including, but not limited to, positions with the State of California.
- (C) That a student enrolled in an unaccredited institution is not eligible for federal financial aid programs.

10. Education Code Section 94910 states in pertinent part:

Except as provided in subdivision (d) of Section 94909 and Section 94910.5, prior to enrollment, an institution shall provide a prospective student with a School Performance Fact

Sheet containing, at a minimum, the following information, as it relates to the educational program:

- (a) Completion rates, as calculated pursuant to Article 16 (commencing with Section 94928).
- (b) Placement rates for each educational program, as calculated pursuant to Article 16 (commencing with Section 94928), if the educational program is designed to lead to, or the institution makes any express or implied claim related to preparing students for, a recognized career, occupation, vocation, job, or job title.
- (c) License examination passage rates for programs leading to employment for which passage of a state licensing examination is required, as calculated pursuant to Article 16 (commencing with Section 94928).
- (d) Salary or wage information, as calculated pursuant to Article 16 (commencing with Section 94928).
- (e) If a program is too new to provide data for any of the categories listed in this subdivision, the institution shall state on its fact sheet: "This program is new. Therefore, the number of students who graduate, the number of students who are placed, or the starting salary you can earn after finishing the educational program are unknown at this time. Information regarding general salary and placement statistics may be available from government sources or from the institution, but is not equivalent to actual performance data."
 - (f) All of the following:
- (1) A description of the manner in which the figures described in subdivisions (a) to (d), inclusive, are calculated or a statement informing the reader of where he or she may obtain a description of the manner in which the figures described in subdivisions (a) to (d), inclusive, are calculated.
- (2) A statement informing the reader of where he or she may obtain from the institution a list of the employment positions determined to be within the field for which a student received education and training for the calculation of job placement rates as required by subdivision (b).

- (3) A statement informing the reader of where he or she may obtain from the institution a list of the objective sources of information used to substantiate the salary disclosure as required by subdivision (d).
 - (g) The following statements:
- (1) "This fact sheet is filed with the Bureau for Private Postsecondary Education.

 Regardless of any information you may have relating to completion rates, placement rates, starting salaries, or license exam passage rates, this fact sheet contains the information as calculated pursuant to state law."
- (2) "Any questions a student may have regarding this fact sheet that have not been satisfactorily answered by the institution may be directed to the Bureau for Private Postsecondary Education at (address), Sacramento, CA (ZIP Code), (Internet Web site address), (telephone and fax numbers)."
- (h) If the institution participates in federal financial aid programs, the most recent threeyear cohort default rate reported by the United States Department of Education for the institution and the percentage of enrolled students receiving federal student loans.
- (i) Data and information disclosed pursuant to subdivisions (a) to (d), inclusive, is not required to include students who satisfy the qualifications specified in subdivision (d) of Section 94909, but an institution shall disclose whether the data, information, or both provided in its fact sheet excludes students pursuant to this subdivision. An institution shall not actively use data specific to the fact sheet in its recruitment materials or other recruitment efforts of students who are not California residents and do not reside in California at the time of their enrollment.
 - 11. Education Code Section 94911 states in pertinent part:

(e) (1) A disclosure with a clear and conspicuous caption, "STUDENT

(e) (1) A disclosure with a clear and conspicuous caption, "STUDENT'S RIGHT TO CANCEL," under which it is explained that the student has the right to cancel the enrollment agreement and obtain a refund of charges paid through attendance at the first class session, or the seventh day after enrollment, whichever is later.

| | ///

(2) The disclosure shall contain the institution's refund policy and a statement that, if the
student has received federal student financial aid funds, the student is entitled to a refund of
moneys not paid from federal student financial aid program funds.

- (3) The text shall also include a description of the procedures that a student is required to follow to cancel the enrollment agreement or withdraw from the institution and obtain a refund.
- (f) A statement specifying that, if the student obtains a loan to pay for an educational program, the student will have the responsibility to repay the full amount of the loan plus interest, less the amount of any refund.
- (g) A statement specifying that, if the student is eligible for a loan guaranteed by the federal or state government and the student defaults on the loan, both of the following may occur:
- (1) The federal or state government or a loan guarantee agency may take action against the student, including applying any income tax refund to which the person is entitled to reduce the balance owed on the loan.
- (2) The student may not be eligible for any other federal student financial aid at another institution or other government assistance until the loan is repaid.
- (h) The transferability disclosure that is required to be included in the school catalog, as specified in paragraph (15) of subdivision (a) of Section 94909.

- (j) The following statements:
- (1) "Any questions a student may have regarding this enrollment agreement that have not been satisfactorily answered by the institution may be directed to the Bureau for Private Postsecondary Education at (address), Sacramento, CA (ZIP Code), (Internet Web site address), (telephone and fax numbers)."
- (2) "A student or any member of the public may file a complaint about this institution with the Bureau for Private Postsecondary Education by calling (toll-free telephone number) or by completing a complaint form, which can be obtained on the bureau's Internet Web site (Internet Web site address)."

| | ///

2.5

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

2.1

22

23

24

25

26

27

. . . .

(e) The institution shall submit at the time it applies for renewal current financial statements that meet the requirements of section 74115 as follows: (1) for an institution with annual gross revenues of \$ 500,000 and over, statements shall be audited; (2) for an institution with annual gross revenues less than \$ 500,000, statements shall be reviewed.

. . . .

- (y) (1) For each program offered, the application shall contain a description of the facilities and the equipment which is available for use by students at the main, branch, and satellite locations of the institution unless there have been no substantive changes since the last submission. If there have been no substantive changes made the institution may so state and is not required to provide documentation.
- (2) For facilities that are leased or rented, the application shall contain the name and address of the lessor or landlord, together with a copy of any use, lease, or rental agreements for the facilities unless there have been no substantive changes since the last submission. If there have been no substantive changes made the institution may so state and is not required to provide documentation.
- (3) The application shall include, in addition to the description of the physical facilities, building diagrams or campus maps to assist the Bureau in locating these facilities. The diagrams or maps shall identify the location of classrooms, laboratories, workshops, and libraries unless there have been no substantive changes since the last submission. If there have been no substantive changes made the institution may so state and is not required to provide documentation.
- (4) The description in the application shall include specifications of significant equipment that demonstrate that the equipment meets the standards prescribed by the Code and this chapter and is sufficient to enable students to achieve the educational objectives of each education program unless there have been no substantive changes since the last submission. If there have been no substantive changes made the institution may so state and is not required to provide documentation.

- (5) For each item of significant equipment, the description in the application shall indicate whether the equipment is owned, leased, rented, or licensed for short- or long-term, or owned by another and loaned to be used without charge unless there have been no substantive changes since the last submission. If there have been no substantive changes made the institution may so state and is not required to provide documentation.
- (6) The application shall contain a list of all permits, certifications, or other evidence of inspections or authorizations to operate required by the jurisdictions within which the institution operates that the institution has obtained, and/or an explanation as to why those permits, certifications, or inspections have not yet been obtained unless there have been no substantive changes since the last submission. If there have been no substantive changes made the institution may so state and is not required to provide documentation.

15. Title 5, CCR, section 71705 states:

An institution shall have a written statement of its mission and the objectives for each educational program. The mission and the objectives shall indicate the kind of education offered. for whom the instruction is intended and the expected outcomes for graduates.

Title 5, CCR, section 71720 states in pertinent part:

- (b) Instructors in an Educational Program Not Leading to a Degree.
- (1) An institution shall employ instructors who possess the academic, experiential and professional qualifications to teach, including a minimum of three years of experience, education and training in current practices of the subject area they are teaching. If an instructor does not possess the required three years of experience, education and training in the subject area they are teaching, the institution shall document the qualifications the instructor possesses that are equivalent to the minimum qualifications.

Title 5, CCR, section 71730 states in pertinent part:

28

- (d) Date by which the student must exercise his or her right to cancel or withdraw, and the refund policy, including any alternative method of calculation if approved by the Bureau pursuant to section 94921 of the Code.
 - 20. Title 5, CCR, section 71810 states:
- (a) Each institution shall provide a catalog pursuant to section 94909 of the Code, which shall be updated annually. Annual updates may be made by the use of supplements or inserts accompanying the catalog. If changes in educational programs, educational services, procedures, or policies required to be included in the catalog by statute or regulation are implemented before the issuance of the annually updated catalog, those changes shall be reflected at the time they are made in supplements or inserts accompanying the catalog.
- (b) The catalog shall contain the information prescribed by Section 94909 of the Code and all of the following:
- (2) A statement of the institution's missions and purposes and the objectives underlying each of its educational programs;
- (4) Language proficiency information, including: (A) the level of English language proficiency required of students and the kind of documentation of proficiency, such as the Test of English as a Foreign Language (TOEFL), that will be accepted; and (B) whether English language services, including instruction such as ESL, are provided and, if so, the nature of the service and its cost;
- (5) Whether any instruction will occur in a language other than English and, if so, the level of proficiency required and the kind of documentation of proficiency, such as the United States Foreign Service Language Rating System, that will be accepted;
- (7) The institution's policies and procedures for the award of credit for prior experiential learning, including assessment policies and procedures, provisions for appeal, and all charges that a student may be required to pay;
 - 21. Title 5, CCR, section 74112 states:

- (a) Format. The format for the Performance Fact Sheet shall be in at least 12 pt. type, in an easily readable font, with 1.15 line spacing and all titles and column headings shall be in bold 14 pt. type, which shall also identify the program for which the Performance Fact Sheet pertains. The Performance Fact Sheet shall contain all and only the information required or specifically permitted by sections 94910 and 94929.5 of the Code or this chapter. A separate Performance Fact Sheet shall be prepared for each program.
- (b) An institution offering educational programs that are too new to provide the required two years of data shall include the date the program began as well as the statement required by section 94910(e) of the Code. The Performance Fact Sheet shall also disclose the estimated date of availability for two full years of data for those programs.
- (c) Institutions approved under section 94874.8 of the Code, which do not include all required information per section 94874.8(a)(4), shall include on the Performance Fact Sheet the date of approval to operate and when the required data will be available.
 - (d) In addition to the definitions contained in section 94928 of the Code:
- (1) "Number of Students Who Began the Program" means the number of students who began a program who were scheduled to complete the program within 100% of the published program length within the reporting calendar year, and excludes all students who cancelled during the cancellation period.
- (2) "Number of On-time Graduates" means the number of students who completed the program within 100% of the published program length within the reporting calendar year.
 - (3) "Gainfully Employed" means:
- (A) (i) The graduate is employed in a job classification under the United States Department of Labor's Standard Occupational Classification codes, using the Detailed Occupation (six-digit) level, for which the institution has identified in its catalog and in its employment positions list required by section 94910(f)(2) of the Code that the program prepares its graduates; and
- (ii) The graduate is employed in a single position or concurrent aggregated positions totaling at least 30 hours per week for 5 weeks (35 calendar days), or totaling at least 20 hours per ///

week for 5 weeks (35 calendar days) with a statement signed by the graduate stating that he or she chose to seek part-time employment rather than fulltime employment after graduation; or

- (B) The graduate is employed by the same employer that employed the graduate before enrollment, and any of the following conditions are met:
- (i) the graduate is employed in an occupation with a different Detailed Occupation (six-digit) level Standard Occupational Classification code than applies to the position in which the graduate was employed before enrollment; or
- (ii) the employer or the graduate provides a statement to the effect that the employment after graduation was the result of a promotion with increased pay, due at least in part to graduation from the program; or
- (iii) the employer or the graduate provides a statement to the effect that the degree or the completed program was required as a condition of continued employment; or
- (C) The graduate is self-employed or working freelance as reasonably evidenced by, but not limited to, a business license, fictitious business name statement, advertising (other than business cards), website, or business receipts or other evidence of income from business; or an attestation signed by the graduate of self-employment or freelance work and dated after graduation.
 - (e) Reporting periods:
- (1) An Annual Report shall include data for all educational programs as defined in section 94837 of the Code for the previous one calendar year.
- (2) A Performance Fact Sheet shall be current and available not later than December 1st, and shall report data for the previous two calendar years based upon the "number of students who began the program," as defined in subdivision (d)(1) of this section and were scheduled to graduate in the reported year(s).
- (f) Total Charges. The institution's Annual Report and Performance Fact Sheet shall include the total charges for a student to complete the program within 100% of the program length. The institution must include the disclosure that there may be additional charges if the program is not completed on-time. Total charges shall be disclosed in the Performance Fact

1	Sheet in a format substantially similar to the format listed below (dates and numbers are for
2	example only):
3	Cost of Educational Program:
4	Total Charges for the program for students completing on-time in 20XX: \$ 50,000.
5	Total Charges may be higher for students that do not complete on-time.
6	Student's Initials: Date:
7	Initial only after you have had sufficient time to read and understand the information.
8	(g) Student Loan/Debt Information.
9	(1) If the institution participates in federal financial aid programs, the institution shall
10	include loan information in the institution's Annual Report and on the Performance Fact Sheet.
11	The loan information shall include:
12	(A) The most recent three year cohort default rate, as reported by the United States
13	Department of Education;
14	(B) The percentage of enrolled students receiving federal student loans;
15	(C) The average amount of federal student loan debt of those graduates who have federal
16	student loan debt in the reporting year; and
17	(D) The percentage of graduates with federal student loans, as calculated by the institution
18	Loan information shall be included in the Performance Fact Sheet in a format substantially
19	similar to the format listed below (dates and numbers are for example only):
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	
27	
28	
	15

1	Federal Student Loan Debt at (Name of Institution)			
2 3	Percentage of students who defaulted on their federal student loans at this school: 28%<1>			
4	Percentage of students enrolled in 20XX who took out federal student loans to pay for this program: 43%			
5	Percentage of graduates in 20XX who took out federal student loans to pay for this program: 65%			
6 7	Average federal student loan debt of 20XX graduates who took out federal student loans at this institution: \$ 26,000			
8	(1) The percentage of students who defaulted on their federal student loans is called the			
9	Cohort Default Rate (CDR). It shows the percentage of this school's students who were more			
10	than 270 days (about 9 months) behind on their federal student loans within three years of when			
11	the first payment was due. This is the most recent CDR reported by the U.S. Department of			
12	Education.			
13	Student's Initials: Date:			
14	Initial only after you have had sufficient time to read and understand the information.			
15	(2) Institutions that do not participate in federal financial aid programs shall include one of			
16	two statements in the Performance Fact Sheet in a format substantially similar to the following:			
17	Students at (name of institution) are not eligible for federal student loans. The U.S.			
18	Department of Education has determined that this institution does not meet the criteria that would			
19	allow its students to participate in federal student aid programs.			
20	or			
21	(Name of Institution) is eligible, but chooses not to participate in federal student aid			
22	programs. So students here do not have federal student loans.			
23	Student's Initials: Date:			
24	Initial only after you have had sufficient time to read and understand the information.			
25	(h) Completion Rates. Reporting of completion rates for an institution's Annual Report			
26	and Performance Fact Sheet shall include, for each educational program, the number of students			
27	who began the program as defined in subdivision (d)(1) of this section, the number of students			
28	available for graduation, number of on-time graduates, and completion rate(s). An optional table			
	16			

may be added to include completion rate data for students completing within 150% of the published program length. For an institution reporting completion data pursuant to section 94929(b) of the Code, completion data shall be separately reported for each program and the Performance Fact Sheet shall disclose, if true, that the completion data is being reported for students completing within 150% of the published program length, and that data is not being separately reported for students completing the program within 100% of the published program length. Programs that are more than one year in length which are reporting 150% Completion Rate will provide four calendar years of data.

Completion rates shall be included in the Performance Fact Sheet in a format substantially similar to the chart below (dates, numbers, and other data shown are for example only):

On-time Completion Rates (Graduation Rates) (includes data for the two calendar years prior to reporting)

Name of Educational Program (Program Length)

Calendar Year	Number of Students Who Began Program			
20XX	100	98	70	71%
20XY	80	80	55	69%

Students Completing Within 150% of the Published Program Length

Name of Educational Program (Program Length)

Student's Initials:

Calendar Year	Number of Studen Who Began Progra		150% Graduates	150% Completion Rate
20XX	100	98	95	97%
20XY	80	80	78	98%
*20XZ	90	90	87	97%
*20YA	87	85	74	87%
*Include	d only if program is n	nore than one year in length		

Date:

28

///

///

1	Job Placement Rates (includes data for the two calendar years prior to reporting)					
2	Name of Educational Program (Program Length)					
3	T (diffe (Number of	ogram (110gi	,		
4	Calendar Year	Students who began	Number of Graduates	Graduates Available for Employment	Graduates Employed in the Field	Placement Rate % employed in the Field
5		Program		Employ ment	the Tieta	the Field
6	20XX	100	70	70	55	79%
7	20XY	80	55	55	20	36%
8	Gainfu	l Employment Ca	ategories (inc	ludes data for the two	o calendar years	s prior to
9	reporting)					
10	Name o	of Educational Pr	ogram (Progi	ram Length)		
11	Part Ti	me vs. Full Time	Employment	t		
12		Graduates En		Graduates Empl the field at least 3		otal Graduates mployed in the
13		per w		per week		Field
14	20XX	15		40		5.5
15	2011	13		40		55
16	20XY	5		15		20
17	Cincle	Docition vo Com	A			
18	Single	Position vs. Cond			1. d	
19 20		Graduates Emp the Field in a Position	Single	Graduates Employe Field in Concur Aggregated Posi	rent E	otal Graduates mployed in the Field
21						
22	20XX	52		3		55
23	20XY	19		1		20
24	Self-Er	nployed/Freeland	ce Positions			
25			oloyed Who A Working Fre	Are Self-employed		ates Employed Field
26			g 2 1 0		III the	
27	20XX	3			55	
28	20XY	5			20	
				19		

STATEMENT OF ISSUES

- 1						
1	Institutional Employment					
2 3	Graduates Employed in the Field Who Are Employed by the Institution, an Employer Owned by the Institution, or an Employer Who Shares Ownership Total Graduates Employed in the Field					
4	with the Institution					
5	20XX 15 55					
6	20XY 5 20					
7						
8	Student's Initials: Date:					
9	Initial only after you have had sufficient time to read and understand the information.					
10	(5) The following self-employment/freelance worker disclosure shall be initialed by					
11	students entering any programs in which the majority of graduates who obtain jobs obtain in this					
12	type of work:					
13	This program may result in freelance or self-employment.					
14	* The work available to graduates of this program is usually for freelance or self-					
15	employment.					
16	* This type of work may not be consistent.					
17	* The period of employment can range from one day to weeks to several months.					
18	* Hours worked in a day or week may be more or less than the traditional 8 hour work day					
19	of 40 hour work week.					
20	* You can expect to spend unpaid time expanding your networks, advertising, promoting					
21	your services, or honing your skills.					
22	* Once graduates begin to work freelance or are self-employed, they will be asked to					
23	provide documentation that they are employed as such so that they may be counted as placed for					
24	our job placement records.					
25	* Students initialing this disclosure understand that either a majority or all of this school's					
26	graduates are employed in this manner and understand what comprises that work style.					
27	Student's Initials: Date:					
28	Only initial after you have had sufficient time to read and understand the information.					
	20					

(j) License Examination Passage Rates. If license examination passage rates are not available from the appropriate state agency, an institution shall collect the information directly from its graduates. If an institution demonstrates that, after reasonable efforts, it is unable to obtain the examination passage information from its graduates, the institution shall report the number of students it could not contact and note in a font the same size as the majority of the data on the Performance Fact Sheet, "License examination passage data is not available from the state agency administering the examination. We were unable to collect data from [enter the number] graduates."

Reporting of license examination passage rates for the Annual Report and the Performance Fact Sheet shall include, for each educational program: the number of graduates in the reported year, the number of documented graduates who passed the first available examination, number of documented graduates who failed the first available examination, the number of graduates for whom data is not available. An optional column may be added to separately report licensing examination data for graduates who take and pass the exam after failing initially. The Annual Report shall also include a description of the processes for attempting to contact those students.

For licensing examinations that are not continuously administered, license examination passage rates shall be included in the Performance Fact Sheet in a format substantially similar to the chart below, (dates, numbers, and other data shown are for example only):

License Examination Passage Rates (includes data for the two calendar years prior to reporting)

21 | ///

22 | ///

23 | ///

Ш

24 | ///

25 | ///

///

///

28 | ///

1	Name of Educational Program (Program Length)					
2	First Available	Date Exam Result	Number of Graduates in	Number of		
3	Exam Date	Announced	Calendar Year	Graduates Taking Exam		
4	2/1/20XX	3/15/20XX	277	80		
5	2/1/2077	3/13/20XX	277	80		
6	6/1/20XX	7/15/20XX	277	100		
7	10/1/20XX	11/15/20XX	277	82		
8	2/1/20XY	3/20/20XX	304	80		
9	6/1/20XY	7/19/20XX	304	100		
11	10/1/20XY	11/19/20XX	304	92		
12	First Available	Number Who	Number Who			
13	Exam Date	Passed Exam	Failed Exam	Passage Rate		
14	2/1/20XX	40	40	50%		
15	6/1/20XX	75	25	75%		
16	10/1/20XX	68	14	76%		
17	3					
18	2/1/20XY	40	40	50%		
19	6/1/20XY	70	30	70%		
20	10/1/20XY	62	30	67%		
21				*		
22	License examin	ation passage data is no	t available from the s	tate agency administering the		
23	examination. We wer	e unable to collect data	from 32 graduates.			
24	Student's Initial	s: Da	te:			
25	Initial only afte	r you have had sufficier	nt time to read and und	derstand the information.		
26	For licensing examinations that are continuously administered, license examination passage					

below (dates, numbers, and other data shown are for example only):

27

28

rates shall be included in the Performance Fact Sheet in a format substantially similar to the chart

1	License	Examination I	Passage Rate	es (includes data f	for the two c	alendar years pr	ior to
2	reporting)						
3	Name o	f Educational I	Program (Pr	ogram Length)			
4	Calendar	Number of (Graduates	Number of	V 1117	nber Who Passe	ed
5	Year	in Calend	ar Year	Graduates Tal Exam	Firs	t Available Exa	m
6	20XX	95		80		40	
7				80		40	
8	20XY	109		100		75	
9	Calenda	ar Vear	Number W First Availa		Passa	ge Rate	
10							
11	20XX		40		50%		
12	20XY		25		75%		
13							
14	License	examination p	assage data	is not available fi	rom the state	agency adminis	stering the
15	examination.	We were unab	le to collect	data from 10 grad	duates.		
16	Student	s Initials:		_ Date:			
17	Initial only after you have had sufficient time to read and understand the information.						
18	(k) Salary and Wage Information.						
19	All Salary and Wage Information shall be reported to the Bureau pursuant to sections						
20	94910(d) and 94929.5(a)(3) of the Code and shall be included in the Performance Fact Sheet, for						
21	each educational program, in a format substantially similar to the chart below (dates, numbers,						
22	salaries, and other data shown are for example only).						
23	///						
24	///						
25	///						
26	///						
27	///						
28	///						
				23			

Salary and Wage Information (includes data for the two calendar years prior to reporting)

Name of Educational Program (Program Length)

Calendar Year	Graduates Available for Employment	Graduates Employed in the Field	\$ 15,000-\$ 20,000	\$ 20,001- \$25,000
20XX	100	70	5	40
20XY	80	55	5	7
Calendar Year	\$ 25,001-\$ 30,000	\$ 30,001-\$ 35,000	No Salary Information Reported	
20XX	6	3	16	
20XY	3	5	35	

A list of sources used to substantiate salary disclosures is available from the school. (Insert how student can obtain this information.)

Student's Initials:	Date:	

Initial only after you have had sufficient time to read and understand the information.

(l) Definitions. Definitions for all terms contained on the Performance Fact Sheet shall be included as part of the Performance Fact Sheet, in the same format as required in subdivision (a).

The following are the definitions for the Performance Fact Sheet:

"Number of Students Who Began the Program" means the number of students who began a program who were scheduled to complete the program within 100% of the published program length within the reporting calendar year and excludes all students who cancelled during the cancellation period.

"Students Available for Graduation" is the number of students who began the program minus the number of students who have died, been incarcerated, or been called to active military duty.

"Number of On-time Graduates" is the number of students who completed the program within 100% of the published program length within the reporting calendar year.

"On-time Completion Rate" is the number of on-time graduates divided by the number of students available for graduation.

"150% Graduates" is the number of students who completed the program within 150% of the program length (includes on-time graduates).

"150% Completion Rate" is the number of students who completed the program in the reported calendar year within 150% of the published program length, including on-time graduates, divided by the number of students available for graduation.

"Graduates Available for Employment" means the number of graduates minus the number of graduates unavailable for employment.

"Graduates Unavailable for Employment" means the graduates who, after graduation, die, become incarcerated, are called to active military duty, are international students that leave the United States or do not have a visa allowing employment in the United States, or are continuing their education in an accredited or bureau-approved postsecondary institution.

"Graduates Employed in the Field" means graduates who beginning within six months after a student completes the applicable educational program are gainfully employed, whose employment has been reported, and for whom the institution has documented verification of employment. For occupations for which the state requires passing an examination, the six month period begins after the announcement of the examination results for the first examination available after a student completes an applicable educational program.

"Placement Rate Employed in the Field" is calculated by dividing the number of graduates gainfully employed in the field by the number of graduates available for employment.

"Number of Graduates Taking Exam" is the number of graduates who took the first available exam in the reported calendar year.

"First Available Exam Date" is the date for the first available exam after a student completed a program.

"Passage Rate" is calculated by dividing the number of graduates who passed the exam by the number of graduates who took the reported licensing exam.

///

"Number Who Passed First Available Exam" is the number of graduates who took and passed the first available licensing exam after completing the program.

"Salary" is as reported by graduate or graduate's employer.

"No Salary Information Reported" is the number of graduates for whom, after making reasonable attempts, the school was not able to obtain salary information.

- (m) Documentation supporting all data reported shall be maintained electronically by the institution for at least five years from the last time the data was included in either an Annual Report or a Performance Fact Sheet and shall be provided to the Bureau upon request; the data for each program shall include at a minimum:
- (1) the list of job classifications determined to be considered gainful employment for the educational program;
- (2) student name(s), address, phone number, email address, program completed, program start date, scheduled completion date, and actual completion date;
- (3) graduate's place of employment and position, date employment began, date employment ended, if applicable, actual salary, hours per week, and the date employment was verified:
- (4) for each employer from which employment or salary information was obtained, the employer name(s) address and general phone number, the contact person at the employer and the contact's phone number and email address, and all written communication with employer verifying student's employment or salary;
- (5) for students who become self-employed, all documentation necessary to demonstrate self-employment;
 - (6) a description of all attempts to contact each student or employer;
- (7) any and all documentation used to provide data regarding license examinations and examination results;
- (8) for each student determined to be unavailable for graduation or unavailable for employment, the identity of the student, the type of unavailability, the dates of unavailability, and the documentation of the unavailability; and

8

11

12

13

14 15

16

17 18

19

20 21

22

23 24

25

26

27

28

- (9) the name, email address, phone number, and position or title of the institution's representative who was primarily responsible for obtaining the students' completion, placement, licensing, and salary and wage data, the date that the information was gathered, and copies of notes, letters or emails through which the information was requested and gathered.
- (n) The institution shall provide on a separate document along with the Performance Fact Sheet the same cancellation disclosure as that which is required to be included with the enrollment agreement by Section 94911(e)(1) of the Code. The separate document shall be substantially the same size as the Performance Fact Sheet and shall be captioned "STUDENT'S RIGHT TO CANCEL" using bold 14 pt. type.
 - Title 5, CCR, section 74115 states in pertinent part: 22.

- (d) "Current" with respect to financial statements means completed no sooner than 120 days prior to the time it is submitted to the Bureau, and covering no less than the most recent complete fiscal year. If more than 8 months will have elapsed between the close of the most recent complete fiscal year and the time it is submitted, the fiscal statements shall also cover no less than five months of that current fiscal year.
 - Title 5, CCR, section 76215 states:
- (a) A qualifying institution shall include the following statement on both its enrollment agreement and school catalog:

"The State of California established the Student Tuition Recovery Fund (STRF) to relieve or mitigate economic loss suffered by a student in an educational program at a qualifying institution, who is or was a California resident while enrolled, or was enrolled in a residency program, if the student enrolled in the institution, prepaid tuition, and suffered an economic loss. Unless relieved of the obligation to do so, you must pay the state-imposed assessment for the STRF, or it must be paid on your behalf, if you are a student in an educational program, who is a California resident, or are enrolled in a residency program, and prepay all or part of your tuition.

You are not eligible for protection from the STRF and you are not required to pay the STRF assessment, if you are not a California resident, or are not enrolled in a residency program."

///

(b) In addition to the statement required under subdivision (a) of this section, a qualifying institution shall include the following statement in its school catalog:

"It is important that you keep copies of your enrollment agreement, financial aid documents, receipts, or any other information that documents the amount paid to the school. Questions regarding the STRF may be directed to the Bureau for Private Postsecondary Education, 2535 Capitol Oaks Drive, Suite 400, Sacramento, CA 95833, (916) 431-6959 or (888) 370-7589.

To be eligible for STRF, you must be a California resident or enrolled in a residency program, prepaid tuition, paid or deemed to have paid the STRF assessment, and suffered an economic loss as a result of any of the following:

- 1. The institution, a location of the institution, or an educational program offered by the institution was closed or discontinued, and you did not choose to participate in a teach-out plan approved by the Bureau or did not complete a chosen teach-out plan approved by the Bureau.
- 2. You were enrolled at an institution or a location of the institution within the 120 day period before the closure of the institution or location of the institution, or were enrolled in an educational program within the 120 day period before the program was discontinued.
- 3. You were enrolled at an institution or a location of the institution more than 120 days before the closure of the institution or location of the institution, in an educational program offered by the institution as to which the Bureau determined there was a significant decline in the quality or value of the program more than 120 days before closure.
 - 4. The institution has been ordered to pay a refund by the Bureau but has failed to do so.
- 5. The institution has failed to pay or reimburse loan proceeds under a federal student loan program as required by law, or has failed to pay or reimburse proceeds received by the institution in excess of tuition and other costs.
- 6. You have been awarded restitution, a refund, or other monetary award by an arbitrator or court, based on a violation of this chapter by an institution or representative of an institution, but have been unable to collect the award from the institution.

7. You sought legal counsel that resulted in the cancellation of one or more of your student loans and have an invoice for services rendered and evidence of the cancellation of the student loan or loans.

To qualify for STRF reimbursement, the application must be received within four (4) years from the date of the action or event that made the student eligible for recovery from STRF.

A student whose loan is revived by a loan holder or debt collector after a period of noncollection may, at any time, file a written application for recovery from STRF for the debt that would have otherwise been eligible for recovery. If it has been more than four (4) years since the action or event that made the student eligible, the student must have filed a written application for recovery within the original four (4) year period, unless the period has been extended by another act of law.

However, no claim can be paid to any student without a social security number or a taxpayer identification number."

FIRST CAUSE FOR DENIAL OF APPLICATION

(Failure to Meet Minimum Requirements of Enrollment Agreement)

- 24. Respondent's application is subject to denial under California Education Code § 94906 subdivision (a) and (b), 94911 subdivisions (e), (1) (3), (f), (g) (1)(2), (h), (j)(1) (2), 94909 subdivision (a)(15), and 5, California Code of Regulations § 71800 subdivisions (b) and (d), 76215 subdivision (a),(b) in that the Respondent failed to meet the minimum requirements for the Enrollment Agreement that was received by the Bureau on or about December 29, 2017. The circumstances are as follows:
- 25. On or about October 27, 2017 the Bureau requested the institution provide a separate statement indicating how it will provide the Enrollment Agreement, disclosures and statements to students when they are unable to understand the terms and conditions of the Enrollment Agreement due to English not being their primary language. The Institution did not provide the requested statement.
- 26. The Enrollment Agreement does not contain the period covered by the Enrollment Agreement.

- 27. The Enrollment Agreement does not contain the date by which the student must exercise their right to cancel or withdraw, and the refund policy. In addition, the Enrollment Agreement does not contain a description of the procedures that a student is required to follow to cancel the Enrollment Agreement or withdraw from the institution and obtain a refund.
- 28. The Enrollment Agreement does not contain specific required statements related to the Student Tuition Recovery Fund (STRF).
- 29. The Enrollment Agreement does not contain a clear and conspicuous caption, "STUDENT'S RIGHT TO CANCEL," under which it is explained that the student has the right to cancel and obtain a refund of charges paid through attendance at the first class session, or the seventh day after enrollment, whichever is later.
- 30. The Enrollment Agreement does not contain a statement that, if the student has received federal student financial aid funds, the student is entitled to a refund of moneys not paid from federal student financial aid program funds.
- 31. The Enrollment Agreement does not include a statement specifying that, if the student obtains a loan to pay for an educational program, the student will have the responsibility to repay the full amount of the loan plus interest, less the amount of any refund.
- 32. The Enrollment Agreement does not include a statement specifying that, if the student defaults on a federal or state loan, both the following may occur: (1) The federal or state government or a loan guarantee agency may take action against the student, including applying any income tax refund to which the person is entitled to reduce the balance owed on the loan. (2) The student may not be eligible for any other federal student financial aid at another institution or other government financial assistance until the loan is repaid
- 33. The Enrollment Agreement does not include the required transferability disclosure that is required to be included in the school catalog.
- 34. The Enrollment Agreement does not include specific required statements directing students to the Bureau for unanswered questions and for filing a complaint with the Bureau.

2.8

SECOND CAUSE FOR DENIAL OF APPLICATION

(Failure to Meet Minimum Operating Standards - Instruction and Degrees Offered)

- 35. Respondent's application is subject to denial under, 5, California Code of Regulations § 71730 subdivisions (b) and (e) in that Respondent failed to provide sufficient documentation to meet the minimum operating standards regarding the instruction and degrees as follows:
- 36. Respondent failed to provide an adequate description of the job description, duty statement or other description of the job duties, responsibilities and performance evaluation for the Chief Academic Officer (CAO).
- 37. Respondent failed to provide copies of relevant certifications or licenses for the CAO. Therefore, the Bureau is unable to determine if the institution's CAO possess' a degree or equivalent acceptable experience at least equal to the highest qualifications required of the institution's faculty.

THIRD CAUSE FOR DENIAL OF APPLICATION

(Insufficient Financial Resources and Statements)

38. Respondent's application is subject to denial under, 5, California Code of Regulations § 74115 subdivision (d) and 71475 subdivision (e) in that Respondent failed to provide sufficient documentation to meet the minimum operating standard where the financial statement provided on December 29, 2017 for the period ending December 31, 2016 was not reviewed and was not current.

FOURTH CAUSE FOR DENIAL OF APPLICATION

(Failure to Meet Minimum Requirements for A Catalog)

- 39. Respondent's application is subject to denial under, California Education Code § 94909 subdivision (a) (5), (10), (14), (16) and, 5, California Code of Regulations § 71770 subdivisions (a) (1) and (c), 71810 subdivisions (a),(b)(2),(4),(5),(7), 76215 subdivision (a) and (b) in that Respondent failed to provide sufficient documentation to meet the minimum operating standard regarding the catalog as follows:
- 40. Respondent failed to provide a separate statement indicating how often the catalog is updated.

- 41. Respondent failed to provide a separate statement indicating how Respondent provides the school catalog to a prospective student or to the general public when requested.
- 42. Respondent failed to provide a catalog that contains the objectives underlying each of its educational programs.
- 43. Respondent failed to provide a catalog that contains compliant admission policies in that it allows admission of students into a diploma program who do not possess a high school diploma or its equivalent.
- 44. Respondent failed to provide a catalog that contains the institution's policies and procedures for the award of credit for prior experiential learning, and the provisions for appeal.
- 45. Respondent failed to provide a catalog that contains language proficiency information, including the level of English language proficiency required of students and the kind of documentation of proficiency, such as the Test of English as a Foreign Language (TOEFL), that will be accepted; and whether English language services, including instruction such as ESL, are provided and, if so, the nature of the service and its cost.
- 46. Respondent failed to provide a catalog that clarifies whether any instruction will occur in a language other than English and, if so, the level of proficiency required and the kind of documentation of proficiency, such as the United States Foreign Service Language Rating System, that will be accepted. Respondent represented that classes may be conducted in Chinese language.
- 47. Respondent failed to provide a catalog that contains a description of the requirements for completion of each program, including required courses, any final tests, or examinations.
- 48. Respondent failed to provide a catalog that contains a statement specifying whether the institution is accredited by an accrediting agency recognized by the United States Department of Education.
- 49. Respondent failed to provide a catalog that contains the required verbatim description of the student's rights and responsibilities with respect to the Student Tuition Recovery Fund (STRF).

- 50. Respondent failed to provide a catalog that contains all consumer information that is required to be disclosed to the student pursuant to federal and state financial aid programs.
- 51. Respondent failed to provide a catalog that contains a description of the instruction provided in each of the courses offered by the institution, including the Practical Massage Therapy and Massage Therapy, MBP-101, Anatomy and Physiology, MBP-102, Kinesiology, MBP-103, Pathology, MBP- 104, Massage and Bodywork Assessment, MBP-105, Swedish Massage, MBP-106, Business Practice and Ethics I, MBP-107, Acupressure and Tui-Na, MBP-108, CPR and First Aid, MBP-109 Reflexology, MBP-110 and Hydrotherapy.

FIFTH CAUSE FOR DENIAL OF APPLICATION

(Failure to Meet Minimum Operating Standards - Mission and Objectives)

52. Respondent's application is subject to denial under, 5, California Code of Regulations §71705 in that Respondent failed to provide sufficient documentation to meet the minimum operating standard regarding the educational objectives for the Tui Na Therapy program.

SIXTH CAUSE FOR DENIAL OF APPLICATION

(Instruction in Language Other Than English)

53. Respondent's application is subject to denial under California Education Code § 94894 subdivision (a) in that on or about December 29, 2017, Respondent advised the Bureau that they may conduct classes in Chinese, however the institution is not approved to offer courses in the Chinese Language.

SEVENTH CAUSE FOR DENIAL OF APPLICATION

(Facilities and Equipment)

54. Respondent's application is subject to denial under, 5, California Code of Regulations §71475 subdivision (y) in that on or about May 1, 2017, the institution submitted a non-substantive change of location less than 10 miles which did not include all of the information regarding the new location required on the Renewal of an Appeal to Operate for a Non-Accredited Institution application. The circumstances are as follows:

- 55. On or about May 1, 2017, the institution submitted a non-substantive change of location. In the deficiency letter sent October 27, 2017, the Bureau requested the following information:
 - a. A description of the facilities and the equipment which is available for use by students at the main, branch, and satellite locations of the institution.
 - b. The name and address of the lessor or landlord, together with a copy of any use, lease, or rental agreements for the facilities.
 - c. The description of the physical facilities, building diagrams or campus maps to assist the Bureau in locating these facilities. The diagrams or maps shall identify the location of classrooms, laboratories, workshops, and libraries.
 - d. Specifications of significant equipment that demonstrate that the equipment meets the standards prescribed by the Code and this chapter and is sufficient to enable students to achieve the educational objectives of each education program.
 - e. For each item of significant equipment, whether the equipment is owned, leased, rented, or licensed for short or long-term, or owned by another and loaned to be used without charge.
 - f. A list of all permits, certifications, or other evidence of inspections or authorizations to operate required by the jurisdictions within which the institution operates that the institution has obtained, and/or an explanation as to why those permits, certifications, or inspections have not yet been obtained.
 - 56. The Institution did not provide the required information.

EIGHTH CAUSE FOR DENIAL OF APPLICATION

(Educational Programs)

57. Respondent's application is subject to denial under 5, California Code of Regulations § 71710 subdivisions (a)-(c) (3) for not meeting the minimum operating standards as to the educational programs. The circumstances are as follows:

- a. On or about October 27, 2017, the Bureau requested the Institution provide a syllabus for each course/module in each educational program. By the response received, the Bureau is unable to determine that each educational program contains subject areas that are necessary for the students to achieve the educational objectives of that educational program, and educational courses or modules that are logically organized and sequenced.
- b. On or about December 29, 2017, the Bureau received a catalog that provided inconsistent class schedules in different sections of the same catalog.
- c. On or about December 29, 2017, the Bureau received a catalog that lists the Massage Therapy program as 1010 Clock Hours, however the total clock hours for the 16 courses comprising the program is 1020. The Bureau is unable to determine the length of the educational program.
- d. On or about December 29, 2017, the Bureau received a catalog that lists the Practical Massage Therapy program as 500 Clock Hours, however the total clock hours for the 12 courses comprising the program is 510. The Bureau is unable to determine the length of the educational program.
- e. On or about December 29, 2017, the Bureau received a catalog that lists inconsistent amounts of clock hours for the course MBP-102. Kinesiology. The Bureau is unable to determine the length of the educational program.
- f. On or about December 29, 2017, the Bureau received a catalog that lists inconsistent amounts of clock hours for the course MBP-104, Massage and Bodywork Assessment. The Bureau is unable to determine the length of the educational program.
- g. On or about December 29, 2017, the Bureau received a catalog that lists inconsistent amounts of clock hours for the course Ref100: The science and art of Reflexology. The institution does not provide the number of lecture hours and the number of laboratory hours. The Bureau is unable to determine the length of the educational program.

- h. On or about December 29, 2017, the Bureau received a catalog that lists inconsistent amounts of clock hours for the Acupressure program that is made up of 2 courses: Accu-101 Introduction to Accupressure, 40 hours; and Accu-102 Deep Tissue Massage. The Bureau is unable to determine the length of the educational program.
- i. On or about December 29, 2017, the Bureau received a catalog that lists a Tui Na Therapy program. However, the catalog does not contain a description of this program. The Bureau is unable to determine if the curriculum includes the subject areas that are necessary for a student to achieve the educational objectives of the educational program in which the student is enrolled.
- j. On or about December 29, 2017, the Bureau received a catalog that lists Accu-103Tui-Na and Accu-103 Advanced Massage and Bodywork Techniques. The numbering system for these two courses is inconsistent. The Bureau is unable to determine if the curriculum includes subject areas and courses or modules
- k. On or about December 29, 2017, the Bureau received a catalog that lists "Accu101 Accupressre". The course titles are the same on both page 23 and page 24
 but the course descriptions are different. The Bureau is unable to determine if
 the curriculum includes the subject areas that are necessary for a student to
 achieve the educational objectives of the educational program in which the
 student is enrolled.
- 1. On or about December 29, 2017, the Bureau received a catalog that lists Accu103 Tui-Na as 40 total clock hours, 20 lecture hours and 20 lab hours; however,
 the course description provided is for the clinical educational setting and does
 not include lecture. The Bureau is unable to determine if the curriculum
 includes the subject areas that are necessary for a student to achieve the
 educational objectives of the educational program in which the student is
 enrolled.

NINTH CAUSE FOR DENIAL OF APPLICATION

(Faculty)

- 58. Respondent's application is subject to denial under 5, California Code of Regulations § 71710 subdivision (f) and 71720 subdivision (b)(1) for not meeting the minimum operating standards as to the faculty. The circumstances are as follows:
 - a. On or about October 27, 2017, the Bureau requested the Institution provide a list of faculty members assigned to teach each course. The Institution did not provide a list of course teaching-assignments for each faculty member. The Bureau is unable to determine if the Institution's program learning outcomes are evaluated by duly qualified faculty.
 - b. On or about October 27, 2017, the Bureau requested the Institution provide a resume, signed employment contract (tentative contracts are acceptable) indicating course assignments, and relevant certifications or licenses for each faculty member. The Institution did not provide faculty resumes, employment contracts or relevant certifications or licenses for each faculty member. The Bureau is unable to determine if the institution employs instructors who possess the academic, experiential and professional qualifications to teach, and training in current practices of the subject area they are teaching.

TENTH CAUSE FOR DENIAL OF APPLICATION

(School Performance Fact Sheets)

- 59. Respondent's application is subject to denial under California Education Code § 94910 and 5, California Code of Regulations § 74112 for not meeting the minimum requirements for a School Performance Fact Sheet. The circumstances are as follows:
- a. On or about October 27, 2017, the Bureau requested the Institution provide a copy of the institution's School Performance Fact Sheet (SPFS). The institution did not provide copies of the SPFS for each program.

///

28 || /

DISCIPLINE CONSIDERATIONS

To determine the degree of discipline, Complainant alleges that:

60. On or about August 16, 2018, the Bureau issued a Citation: Assessment of Fine and Order of Abatement No. 1819019 fine for failing to electronically file its 2016 annual report. Respondent was ordered to submit its Annual Report in accordance with 5, California Code of Regulations § 74110 (a-d) and California Education Code § 94934(a)(1-9) and pay a fine of \$5,000. Citation: Assessment of Fine and Order of Abatement No. 1819019 was modified on November 6, 2018 and fine was reduced to \$500.00. As of January 28, 2019, the Assessment of Fine and Order of Abatement has been complied with.

PRAYER

WHEREFORE, Complainant requests that a hearing be held on the matters herein alleged, and that following the hearing, the Director of the Department of Consumer Affairs issue a decision:

- 1. Denying the application of Avid Career College, Manli Yu, Owner, for Renewal of Approval to Operate an Institution Non-Accredited;
 - 2. Taking such other and further action as deemed necessary and proper.

DATED: 2/7/19

DR. MICHAEL MARION, JR.

Bureau Chief

Bureau for Private Postsecondary Education

Department of Consumer Affairs

State of California Complainant

LA2018601544 62936646.docx